

Further submission from the British Pakistani Christian Association

Page | 1 Contents

Introduction and comments on Internal relocation, biometric ID cards and databases, and on UK asylum processes - feelings of intimidation with translators, lack of understanding of less liturgical church practices. P3-4

Adaptation from letter to MP's covering sexual violence and slavery, education system, the government and police crackdown and media incitement to violence against Christians in the aftermath of the recent double suicide bombings of churches, the terror threats Christians face, and moral and practical arguments for the prioritization of Christian refugees in general, as well as the worldwide effects of the Home Office position denying Christians in Pakistan are generally persecuted. P5-8

Large extracts from a report in a recent (and ongoing) asylum appeal case involving sexual harassment of the daughters in the family (p9-34):

- a) *Paragraphs about general situation and attacks on Christian churches and areas from 2002-2015, as well as general population attitudes, intimidation of the judiciary in religiously sensitive cases and an example of targeting of a Christian leader and his family (p9-13)*
- b) *paragraphs about sexual abuse and assault of Christian women, police indifference or complicity, police brutality against Christians 1999-2015 (p14-18)*
- c) *Paragraphs on the sufferings of deportees from West, conversion as self-protection, and how official minority quotas reinforce subservient status, and Christian experience in universities (p19)*
- d) *Paragraphs concerning targeting by extremist groups, religious apartheid, social conditions and general impracticalness of internal relocation (p20-21)*
- e) *Paragraphs on sufficiency of protection issues around Christians, especially women, as well as the weakness of arguments around police professionalism improvements (p22-24)*
- f) *Detailed critique of recent Country Guidance : [2014] UKUT 569 AK & SK (Christians: risk) (CG). (p25-34)*

Additional Annexes from TTMOP and other sources (p35-57)

Annex Regarding Sexual harassment and assault of Christian women from TTMOP p394-6 (p35-8)

Annex on Religion and Blasphemy from TTMOP p283 (p39)

Annex on Kanewal and Shanti-Nagar attack – January and February 1997, psychological effects ongoing, police incitement (p40-42)

Annex on 'Wrong Way' Mixed Marriages in Pakistan (p43-47)

Annex on Shazia Bashir's murder by Top Pakistani Lawyer (p48-9)

Annex on Christians burned alive in Pakistan in the last year. (p50)

Annex on Christians experience of Mainstream University (p51-53)

Annex on Police and Security force brutality against Christians. (p54-7)

Introduction

We have been asked to contribute more material, over and above what we presented at the oral testimonies. I am Nathanael Lewis, a BPCA researcher and expert who submitted written testimony to the oral testimonies.

Page | 3

Firstly, if people wanted to examine the situation of Christians up until late 2012 in detail, they can obtain copies of 'The Targeting of Minority Others in Pakistan' (hereafter abbreviated to TTMOP), which details the situation of many minorities, but about 1/3 of it is concerning the history and plight of Christians, both thematically, and chronologically (it is available here - <http://www.britishpakistanichristians.co.uk/blog/the-targeting-of-minority-others-in-pakistan>).

I have not had much time to prepare this additional evidence, so I have utilized previous material from letters to MP's and from a recent report for an asylum appeal case (lightly edited). Please forgive the inevitable bits of overlap. Where I am lifting from already written documents I indicate, and any hyperlinks from footnotes from the report mentioned above worked at the time of print in early 2013.

I would like to say something further first of all about internal relocation. Many Christian asylum seekers are told by UK decision makers that they have not adequately explored the option of internal relocation to another area of Pakistan (even though in some cases the asylum seekers have already had to flee a number of different locations). In some cases, decision makers / judges have clearly thought that an extremist, even with access to government information, would have to manually trawl through millions of files or lines of information to find, for instance, a blasphemy accused who had fled into hiding, and therefore it was not realistic for a Pakistani Christian to expect to be found if they fled to another locale. The internal relocation argument is problematic in itself (to truly go underground means to not work, and not be able to provide for yourself, challenging to even a relatively well off middle-class Christian family, let alone the more common impoverished variety – people have to eat to live, and work to eat, and there are many examples of such relocated Christians being quickly hunted down, and several ways extremist groups can do this without insiders in government officers helping), but it also is not consonant with reality. We are given to understand from people in UK government departments that it in most cases it is very easy with only very limited details to find a person within seconds using departmental systems. However, the UK in at least some respects has less information to work with than extremist sympathisers or insiders do within Pakistani government departments. We understand that Pakistan is generally said to have the largest database of biometric data in the world. ID cards are biometric, and contain information on a person's religion. Even if Pakistan chose not to show religion on the ID cards themselves, it would still be on the database (and for some Christians, their very name is a giveaway as to their religion), and so it almost certainly would be extremely easy for an insider to find them within seconds. This means that the great expenditure of time and energy that judges seem to think are required to track down internally relocated Christians are illusory. And even if an extremist group does not have a sympathetic insider to tap, in the days of texts and emails and photo by text, plus close family networks to tap into, and a wide network of extremist supporters who can be tapped into (and a limited number of areas with large Christian populations) it is not that onerous to track down a relocated Christian anyway.

Secondly, we do have indications that Pakistani Christian asylum seekers often feel intimidated because the translators at their asylum interviews are usually Muslim, in much the same way that female victims of sexual violence are intimidated by male translators. We recommend a greater drive to recruit accredited 'minority faith' translators and to use them wherever practicable (I imagine this would apply to those coming from nations in which similar conditions apply).

Page | 4 Additionally – and again this applies far more widely than just Pakistani Christians – it is evident that often Christian asylum seekers credibility with regard to their faith is assessed on more 'academic' head knowledge such as naming the twelve apostles and less on experiential faith, and often it is clear that decision makers are operating on the basis that most churches are more or less Anglican / Catholic in approach and not fully caught up to the diversity of Christian churches and expressions. We recommend gaining knowledge of non-traditional denominations and movements such as Pentecostals / charismatics, not just head knowledge, but to gain something of the flavour of their religious life. Also, it would be helpful for translators to have a better understanding of religious terms and concepts to aid more accurate translation.

Adapted from a letter to MP's

Page | 5

The Pakistani state education system, let alone the Mosque schools, portray Christians and other minorities in a bad and dehumanizing light, a problem not addressed despite the fact that British and other Western nation's tax money and aid goes to support literacy campaigns without addressing these wider and deeply concerning issues in the education system in Pakistan. Christians are widely seen as 'chooras', a term roughly equivalent to 'dirty nigger' (and one that is widely reported as being used in government circles behind closed doors), and their women and girls seen as effectively prostitutes, easy and the right of any Muslim man to take, whether they be a young schoolgirl or a married mother of numerous children. Impoverished women and young girls who work as maids are particularly vulnerable to sexual abuse, and even schoolgirls going to school usually require an escort of male relatives. There is at least one documented case where in a village the whole population of Christian women are essentially held in forced sexual slavery whilst their men work in the fields. Rape of Christian women is rife, at untold levels, and the rate of cases where Christian girls are kidnapped, gang-raped and forced into sexual slavery a.k.a. 'marriage' and conversion to Islam is estimated at, at the least, two a day. Brothels are routinely put in Christian areas, and other tactics can be used – for instance seeking to get the often impoverished fathers or husbands of beautiful Christian women into illegal trades or situations where they can be blackmailed into giving over their women to the sex trade. It is very common for Christian girls and women going to church to pray to be sexually harassed. Sexual targeting of Christian women used to be thought to be particularly bad in rural areas, but it is increasingly becoming apparent that suburban areas are perhaps as bad, maybe even worse, although it is difficult to say for sure due to social conditions that hinder accurate reporting.

You will doubtless be aware of the double suicide bombing of two churches in Lahore, Pakistan, on Sunday 15th March 2015. What you may not be aware of is the situation since then. Let me recount what you may not know. In one case, a young security guard at the church managed to intercept the suicide bomber and stop him detonating the suicide bomb. However, a gunman accomplice opened fire on him to detonate the bomb from a distance. In the immediate horrific aftermath of the explosions, a few nearby Christians turned on that gunman and another gunman accomplice arrested by police, and unfortunately beat them severely and set fire to them, killing them – a fate that all too often meets genuinely innocent Christians, previously inflicted on a young married couple with five children who were beaten to a pulp, doused in petrol and thrown alive into the village brick kiln where they worked in late 2015, and since then a Christian teenager in the metropolis of Lahore beaten and burnt alive solely because he was a Christian. In the case of the double bombing, the police guards, all too typically, were watching cricket in a coffee shop, leaving church members to perform security functions, just as the police stood by when that couple were burned to death late last year.

However, the situation got far, far worse. The police went around beating up anyone with a cross on their person or vehicle, impounding vehicles for no reason other than the owner is a Christian, as well as demanding that Christian individuals pay them 'jizya' tax – imposed under Sharia on non-Muslims for the privilege of remaining alive unconverted – for 'killing innocent Muslims'. Christians have been rounded up and arrested and brutally tortured by the police - not just those that protested, but any Christian in the vicinity. Despite the Christian community handing over the names of those involved in the killings and some property destruction, the police illegally raided

houses and detained relatives of suspects, beating and sexually assaulting women when they protested at the invasion. The police spread fear by telling local Christians that they should move out of their homes, because they would not protect them from the anticipated violent mob. Conditions nationally appeared to be ripe for genocide. Already dehumanized, symbolized, discriminated against and degraded, the situation of Christians matches the recognized precursors for genocide. The media – and this must be with at least the passive complicity of the government of Pakistan – spoke as one with extremist Islamic leaders and Mosque announcements which have called for mass attacks on churches across the country during Sunday worship. The media whipped up this hatred by stating that Christians killed two innocent Muslims bystanders, and should therefore be punished, and the government itself took a similar line, further endangering Christians. At the same time a prominent champion of Pakistani Christians, the British Pakistani Christian Association (BPCA) received online threats from a Pakistani individual claiming to act on the part of the hacker group Anonymous claiming equal moral culpability of the terror group that did the suicide bombings and the whole Pakistani Christian community worldwide, and calling on all Anonymous hackers to attack the online social media sites of both Pakistani Christians and the terror group that claimed responsibility for the bombings. This is the type of mentality that is moving the massed mobs of Pakistan, except that there the threat is not against electrons and servers, but to their very lives and ability to live and exist and worship as Christians - in short, just like many Christians across the Middle East, and in parts of Africa, they are now facing the possibility of out and out genocide.

Pakistani Christians have already had to live under a permanent state of some degree of terror, watching as they suffered more and more abuse and their defenders were assassinated, even up to Federal Minister level, but now they are utterly terrified. For a long time there have been calls from some Christian activists in the nation, however unrealistic, for them to have their own state where they can be unmolested, because their suffering and degradation was so bad, but now they are calling for weapons to defend themselves, guns and armour, and indeed some churches have long had the practice of hiring weapons such as AK47's to mount guard outside church services from time to time. ISIS has recently recruited thousands of militants in Pakistan, with at least one Taliban commander on record saying that his men are 'waiting for the right moment' to join, but Pakistani Christians have no equivalent of Kurdistan where they can flee to, unlike the Christians of Iraq who face ISIS, nor do they have a government that seems prepared to act to protect them, as the Christians of Syria do to some extent – although the Pakistani army has recently warned some church pastors that ISIS intends to launch a wave of attacks on churches and Christians and warned them to take precautions. They have no defenders, no protectors. By and large, the police of Pakistan side with the extremists. The intelligence services often work hand in hand with extremist Mullahs to harass Christians, even those in the UK and the West, by harassing their families back in Pakistan.

Whilst the threatened attacks didn't occur, sooner or later they will. If not this week, then next week, or next month, genocide will happen, barring a miracle for which the Christians of Pakistan are desperately praying.

We repeatedly hear from Pakistani church leaders a common refrain – that they see their persecutors gain residence in the West, sometimes gaining asylum, but Christians find it very difficult to get asylum or refuge in the West. Some countries will only take you if you are not already in the

country if you have gained refugee status from the UN. We are repeatedly told that that Muslim UN staff members and / or local embassy members in their home nation block and divert their attempts by Christians to gain such status, not just in Pakistan, but also in some other Muslim states as well.

Page | 7

Western governments have a moral responsibility to be pro-active in rescuing from genocide those who are most naturally attuned to our values of democracy, freedom of worship and speech and so on, and genocide is either already happening or on the verge of happening across the Middle East and in nations like Pakistan. We stand at a point akin to the one that the democratic Western nations stood at in the late 1930's regarding the Jews, where at best a relative few were given grudging asylum, but the rest left to their fate.

There are a number of practical advantages to welcoming Christian refugees in particular. Firstly, there is the low national security risk. The likelihood of terrorists being among this group is vanishingly small, especially compared to some other groups. With proper liaison with local community leaders, the risk of outsiders infiltrating in by pretending to be Christian can be kept low. This means a speedier, more efficient and cheaper process. Secondly, Christian refugees have a good track record of integrating well into the societies where they have found refuge whilst still retaining their distinctive culture, and yet contributing constructively to the host nation's diversity and public life. Thirdly, if their integration is handled right, they can become a valuable bridge between the host nation and the wider national communities and language groups of which they form a part. Moreover, having gone through the experience of persecution, they will be more sensitive to signs of radicalization and extremism, than the local community, which we believe to be seriously hampered by unhelpful political correctness. Although thought must be given to their potential vulnerability, handled correctly they will likely prove to be useful to both local and national government, as well as police and security forces; in particular in helping them avoid funding and making alliances with groups that claim they are moderate but in reality are anything but, something we have seen happen a number of times. They will have an especial motivation not to encourage or facilitate here the persecution they suffered in their home country, and so can contribute powerfully to protecting the whole of society.

In the light of this, we urge you to speak up for the UK to follow, and even exceed, the example of Holland, not only giving Christian refugees from Pakistan and other countries where genocide by extremists is either happening or increasingly likely special status, but pro-actively working to tear down barriers that would prevent genuinely needy and endangered Christians from gaining refuge, whether that be an overly strict and out of touch asylum process here in the UK, or barriers to religiously persecuted individuals actually reaching this country or places of refuge in the West generally. As I understand it, for instance, the US and UN are facilitating some Syrians of particular Muslim sects in gaining refuge in the US because they are persecuted by the Syrian government or state, but denying such refuge to Christians because they are not being persecuted by the Syrian state, but are terrorized and facing genocide by the non-state actors Islamic State, Al-Nusra / Al Qaeda and similar groups. This is unconscionable, and we are calling upon the government to urgently and thoroughly address this kind of imbalance and injustice.

Additionally, in the particular case of Pakistan, I also believe that the government can and must do more in using taxpayers' money in aid to Pakistan. I am not talking about pouring more money in, but I am concerned that money being used in literacy and education campaigns – which I support in

principle – will not result in greater improvements in the propagation and expansion of human rights in Pakistan unless the incitement and dehumanization of minorities by Pakistani textbooks and educators is firmly addressed, and that an opportunity for leverage is being substantially squandered.

Page | 8 Furthermore, because the UK is followed by a number of other countries, it is particularly unconscionable that the official guidance states that Christians in Pakistan are only ‘discriminated against’, but not generally persecuted. This is flatly false, has been flatly false for a long time, and is getting more and more false each and every month. The persecution of Christians in Pakistan has been worsening, and even in the face of the rise of ISIS related groups in the Middle East and North Africa over the last couple of years, Pakistan has been independently assessed as getting worse in its treatment of Christians, moving from 14th worst to 8th worst in 2015. Given that the UNHCR is citing the UK’s country guidance on Pakistani Christians as a reason for not prioritizing Christian refugees and asylum seekers desperately seeking refuge, even in places such as Thailand where they are horrifically treated and dying of treatable illnesses in significant numbers, the UK has a moral imperative to change the official guidance, and so we call on the Home Office to address this absurdity with great urgency, and also call on it to prioritize Christian refugees from Pakistan and other similar nations. The reason for this is that generally Christians in these countries face worse persecution, fewer options and locations for safety and greater road blocks to escaping to the West. In this country, governments have repeatedly put in place programs to elevate the life chances of those who are deemed to suffer some kind of systematic disadvantage as a group, and these same principles should be applied to the situation of Christian refugees and asylum seeker, particularly those from Pakistan, as both Holland and Canada have done.

Extensive extracts from a recent report in an asylum appeal case

a) Paragraphs about general situation and attacks on Christian churches and areas from 2002-2015, as well as general population attitudes, intimidation of the judiciary in religiously sensitive cases and an example of targeting of a Christian leader and his family

Page | 9

4. Firstly, I would like to talk about the general conditions in Pakistan for Christians. Over the last couple of years, even in a world where the situation for Christians has been worsening in many nations, Pakistan has jumped up have a dozen rankings because of the worsening situation there, and I see no sign of the trend stopping. According to the World Watch-list Pakistan now ranks as 8th worst in the world, ranking just below Iran, but just above the war-torn Eritrea, where 100's are imprisoned for their faith. World Watchlist have developed a system whereby they systematically examine five areas of life, even aside from outright violence, to comprehensively determine the severity of persecution of and discrimination against Christians in various countries. The five spheres are private life, family life, community life, national life and church life. Their most recent 2014 report, published after the Country guide for Christians mentioned above, has been independently audited by the International Institute for Christian freedom (<http://www.iirf.eu/>). It is worth quoting a Pakistan 2014 summary in full (<http://www.worldwatchlist.org.au/#!pakistan/c13tb>):

What is it like for Christians in Pakistan?

Pakistan's Christians are caught in the crossfire between Islamic militant organizations and violent mobs that routinely target Christians, and an Islamizing culture that results in Christians being isolated from the rest of the population. Many Christians who can afford to leave the country are leaving.

The notorious blasphemy laws continue to have devastating consequences for minorities, including Christians. Often, allegations of blasphemy turn out to be raised for the sake of settling personal scores, but of course this results in Christians having to act with extreme caution. Christian converts from Islam, if discovered, face the strongest opposition and therefore, will keep their conversion secret or even relocate for their own safety.

It is dangerous to keep Christian materials at home, as allegations of proselytization can happen at any time.

Church buildings often have to be hidden behind high walls and sometimes rather resemble fortresses. Congregations have to hire and pay guards. Moreover, women and girls are experiencing violence every day, especially those from minority groups who are vulnerable and easy targets for rape and sexual abuse.

Adding to the persecution of Christians, there has also been an increase of international radical Islamic groups, such as Islamic State, Al Qaeda and the Taliban.

My own experience confirms this general assessment. I received a number of reports from Pakistani church pastors on the ground via social media, reporting increasing signs of the 'black flags' of various extremist groups in a number of cities (generally regarded as 'safer' than rural areas for Christians), as well as attempts at kidnap of Christians in areas like the Joseph and Youhanabad colonies in Lahore, generally reckoned as safe by reports recommending internal relocation instead

of asylum in the UK. (The latter was also the target of the twin suicide bombings of two churches simultaneously earlier this year). Churches are fairly frequent targets for attack, although drive-by shootings and some arson cases don't make the Western news much.

I list a number of further attacks on churches or Christian institutions (by no means exhaustive), with page numbers from TTMOP or links to web articles and initial reports.

December 2002 TTMOP p314 Hand grenades at Christmas day service, 3 girls killed, 13 injured, some with permanent life-changing injuries, local media blame the victims, pressure to drop charges.

May 2003 TTMOP p315 Sexual harassment of females going to prayer meeting, then enter into church with weapons, violent attacks on church members, stabbing, beating.

March 2005 Village church near Lahore – four gunmen open fire for half an hour on Christians leaving Easter Sunday service, one young father dead, many others injured.

November 2005 to January 2006 TTMOP p325-7 2000 strong mob ransacks and loots 4 churches, convent, missionary school, many police officers join in, imams blame priests and say they set fire to own churches, anonymous threats to church leaders over ensuing months.

February 2006 – TTMOP p327 500 strong mob with petrol bombs burn two Catholic churches and a convent school, 800 bibles and Christian books burned, statues smashed. Separate incident – a group of mainly Muslim women attack village Catholic church in Punjab, injuring several Christians severely, smashing windows, alter, burning bibles. Riots across country, Christian buildings often targeted by mobs, including many Christian schools, one Christian hospital, one church.

April 2006 TTMOP p328 looting and arson attacks on several churches

August 2006 TTMOP p329-30 Attack on church by ramming with tractor, injuring Christians praying inside, raid Christian homes and drag out and beat Christian women, return with large mob and burn down church, including use of grenades.

November 2006 TTMOP p331 Muslim men rebuked for sexual harassment of women going to church, return with friends armed with guns and clubs and drive out members, pelt stones at church – police connive with the attackers. Ongoing abuse and misuse of church.

June 2007 TTMOP p335 Armed attack with guns, sticks and axes, guns fired, axe attacks on Salvation Army church members, severe injuries.

July 2007 TTMOP p336-7 Repeated beatings and attacks by police on Christian pastor in his home, at church and in police stations, released after repeated bribes. Pastor gets ongoing death threats.

October 2007 P338-9 Mob of 300 throws stones, excrement at church walls, cuts wires. All 8 town mosques publicly call for jihad and 'final attack' on church, Christians to convert or die.

December 2008 TTMOP p347 Muslims set fire to a church while church members decorated it for Christmas, left message saying all Christians burn in hell unless convert.

February 2009 TTMOP p349 Feb 09 Well co-ordinated multiple vector attack on Christian church and Christian homes, beating Christians, killing woman, wounding 16, mob fires guns to prevent ambulances from taking wounded to hospital.

April 2009 TTMOP p351 Near Karachi, Christians scrub pro-Taliban graffiti off church wall, armed men arrive to stop them, firing indiscriminately into crowd, 11 year old boy killed, others injured, and possibly more deaths (unconfirmed). Police scattered Christians as they protested before attack on them, did nothing to stop the attackers. Local press blame Christians and say they were initiators.

May 2009 TTMOP p353 Church in North West totally ransacked, altar destroyed, bibles burned etc.

July – August 2009 TTMOP p359-263. Major incident at Gojra and Korian, four churches burned down, 100 Christian homes looted, 50 of them burned down, one with family of 7 or 8 inside, several others killed outside plus a pregnant Christian woman shot dead.

September 2009 TTMOP p363 Sialkot churches set on fire, bibles burned, cross desecrated.

December 2009 TTMOP p365 Mob attack on a church and congregation actually within the grounds of a police station, police refuse to register a case against perpetrators.

December 2009 TTMOP p366 Armed mob attack Christmas eve service, injuring 65 members, including women and children, police refuse to register case or file report.

February 2010 TTMOP Attack on Christian region for 2 hours by mob, including shooting at a church.

March 2010 TTMOP p371 At least two attempted attacks on churches.

April 2010 TTMOP p374 Muslim militants storm a church on Good Friday, desecrating bibles, one Christian shot, Christian family held hostage.

April 2010 TTMOP p375-6. Christians protest at pro-Taliban graffiti on church walls, men armed with heavy weapons immediately appear and start shooting, burning Christian homes, bibles, with 6 Christians shot.

July 2010 TTMOP p382 Attack on Catholic church, bricks thrown, attempt to smash down gates.

July 2010 TTMOP p383 Hand grenade tossed at church, but fails to detonate.

July 2010 TTMOP p384 Threats made against church, police refuse to deal with it, armed attack kills 5 Christians including pastor, injures another 5, media refuse to report it due to threats.

July 2010 TTMOP p385 Ongoing attacks on church – stone throwing by students at Madrassa, also 12 year old Christian girl gang-raped by these Madrassa students.

September 2010 TTMOP p388 and 390 Karachi – Pentecostal church attacked, smashed down gates, took out crosses and bibles and burned them. Second church attacked with similar MO.

November 2010. TTMOP p391 Attack on Lahore church service, congregation beaten, thrown out, church bulldozed to the ground, police side with attackers. Also see bottom of Christian section in <http://www.southasianrights.org/wp-content/uploads/2011/06/Status-of-Minorities-Pakistan-2010.pdf>

Page | 12

March 2011 TTMOP p396 Sexual harassment of Christian women at a Catholic church in a supposedly high security area in Hyderabad, then attackers started shooting, one Christian killed.

March 2011 TTMOP p397 Repeated attempts to attack church, the pressure then used by imams as pretext / leverage to shut down and hinder church activities.

April 2011 TTMOP p398 Attacks or attempted attacks on Gujunwrala churches, Christians homes and theological school after calls from local Mosques to kill Christians and destroy their homes, particularly after falsely accused prominent Christians released after fraudulent blasphemy charges.

May 2011 TTMOP p394. Attack on church service by men armed with pistols and rifles, desecrated bibles and crosses.

August 2011 TTMOP p406 Attack on church congregation in Abbattabad park.

January 2012 TTMOP p289 and 416-7. Attack on Pentecostal church and Christian children practicing for carol service. Church leaders forced to apologize.

August 2012 TTMOP p249. Gunmen open fire on Catholic church in Karachi in night.

August 2012 p430. Gunmen open fire on a church in Hyderabad, killing one Christian.

September and October 2012 TTMOP p52-3 and 299. Attacks on Anglican church and church school, also attacks on churches / churches closed down by Muslim landlords after Rimsha Masih blasphemy case.

October 2012 TTMOP p299 Mosques in village call for punishment of pastor for teaching the bible in prayer meeting in Christian home as 'blasphemer liable to be killed'.

November 2013 Massive suicide double suicide bomb attack on Peshawar church, deaths and severe injuries in 100's. Some hospitals / staff refuse to treat Christian injured, and reports of medical staff selling victims organs on black market. Christian protests end in police brutality and mob attacks on churches and Christian homes, several churches burned down.

<http://www.britishpakistanichristians.co.uk/BlogRetrieve.aspx?PostID=515070&A=SearchResult&SearchID=301140&ObjectID=515070&ObjectType=55> (see about two thirds of the way down),

<http://www.britishpakistanichristians.co.uk/blog/hundreds-of-lahore-christians-flee-burning-blasphemy-mob> and

<http://www.britishpakistanichristians.co.uk/BlogRetrieve.aspx?PostID=547262&A=SearchResult&SearchID=301140&ObjectID=547262&ObjectType=55>

February 2015 Catholic church robbed by armed men who held officials hostage. Feb 15

<http://www.britishpakistanichristians.co.uk/blog/catholic-church-robbed-at-gunpoint-for-second-time>

March 15 Double suicide bombings of two churches simultaneously in Youhanabad – for much more detail on the aftermath, police brutality and media incitement to murder, see below at subparagraph 18 c), but also see <http://www.britishpakistanichristians.co.uk/blog/lahore-twin-church-bombing-update>

Page | 13 April 2015 <http://www.britishpakistanichristians.co.uk/blog/another-attack-on-christians-in-lahore-leave> gun attack on Christian school

May 2015 - <http://www.britishpakistanichristians.co.uk/blog/church-attacked-by-armed-assailants-injuring-sixincluding-pastor> Second attack in a week on church, church vandalized, six injured including pastor, police refuse to register a case.

5. Pew forum surveys have consistently reported high levels of support in Pakistan for extreme Sharia positions, with a minimum of nearly 2/3 of the Muslim population supporting the death penalty for those who convert from Islam to another faith (<https://www.washingtonpost.com/blogs/worldviews/wp/2013/05/01/64-percent-of-muslims-in-egypt-and-pakistan-support-the-death-penalty-for-leaving-islam/> and see the comment dated 14 May 14 for why the true figures may be higher). In a society where extremist groups who are willing and eager to punish every conversion, or every affront to Islam they can, this means that they have a huge 'pond' in which to swim in and gain support from, even if a significant portion of those with such views *may* not actively participate in enforcing their views or taking action accordingly. These extremist groups have often taken time to cultivate links with sympathetic people or outright supporters within the police and other security forces, and among the lawyer community, and will often actively work to impede attempts by minorities to get justice. It is not at all uncommon for groups of extremist imams and/or their students to turn up en masse at court cases to intimidate judges – especially in the lower courts, but sometimes in higher courts too – to deny justice and render Islamically acceptable verdicts, particularly in the case of minority faith defendants who are accused of blasphemy or otherwise are deemed to be problematic because they have in some way stood up for themselves and against their oppression.

5b. The situation in Karachi. Karachi has a well deserved reputation of being particularly lawless, even for a Pakistani city, and Taliban or Taliban related groups in particular are active in the city. I have personally met a quite senior Christian church leader who has faced repeated attempts to kidnap him, his parents and his children from the Taliban, as well as death threats, shootings outside his house, and his cousin severely beaten by extremists looking for him on Minorities Day, no less, and then also abused by the police. This pastor now effectively lives in exile, taking training in the USA. There have been a number of attacks on the Christian slum area Essa Nagri, and that area and its children are also targeted by pimps and sexual slave trade rings.

b) paragraphs about sexual abuse and assault of Christian women, police indifference or complicity, police brutality against Christians 1999-2015

Page | 14

6. The families fears about facing – at best – indifference in dealing with incidents of sexual abuse, rape, kidnap and the like against Christian women is very well founded. There may well be cases where these matters are well handled, but they appear to be few and far between. In researching and writing TTMOP, I came across many cases where Christian parents were turned away, harassed, beaten, or told ‘Your daughters are Muslim now, you will never see them again’ or ‘You will never see them unless you convert to Islam’. In a few cases, this initial reluctance was only overcome when the Christian community staged protests and blocked roads, but this, of course, does not inspire confidence in the ensuing investigations. Typically the families of the perpetrators, who are often from locally powerful perpetrators will bring intense pressure to bear not only on the police, but also on the usually vulnerable and impoverished victim’s families. Whilst some urban better off Christians might be potentially better placed to resist such pressure, that is only in relative terms. (For a general account of the situation – and this was several years ago, when the general situation was not as bad as it is now, see TTMOP p294-298).

Christian women are generally seen as ‘easy’ and ‘fair game’ and criminals frequently place their brothels and prostitution rings in Christian localities in part for precisely this reason, and in part because it is in many ways easier to operate there than in Muslim majority areas who may have both the will and the power to resist them, whereas Christians may have the will, but not the social power to resist. The resulting situation is summed up in this quote from TTMOP p296:

One local priest in the aftermath of a sexual attack summed up the attitude behind such attacks as follows:

‘Christian girls are considered goods to be damaged at leisure. Abusing them is a right. According to the community's mentality it is not even a crime. Muslims regard them as spoils of war.’

Aside from the more serious assaults, Christian women and girls routinely experience sexual harassment, often having to run a gauntlet of abuse while going into and out of church services and prayer meetings.

Christian and minority women face a higher risk because both Pakistani general culture and even the secular courts, particularly at a lower level, are highly influenced by Sharia concepts in which a man’s testimony is worth twice that of a woman, and a Muslim’s twice that of a non-Muslim, so the power differential when it is the word of a Muslim man against a non-Muslim women is extremely large and so makes minority women an especially tempting target. The legal side of this dynamic is aptly summed up by the Wikipedia article on Freedom of Religion in Pakistan:

The Hudood Ordinances criminalize non-marital rape, extramarital sex, and various gambling, alcohol, and property offences. The Hudood Ordinances are applied to Muslims and non-Muslims alike. Some Hudood Ordinance cases are subject to Hadd, or Quranic, punishment; others are subject to Tazir, or secular punishment.

Although both types of cases are tried in ordinary criminal courts, special rules of evidence apply in Hadd cases, which discriminate against non-Muslims. For example, a non-Muslim

may testify only if the victim also is non-Muslim. Likewise, the testimony of women, Muslim or non-Muslim, is not admissible in cases involving Hadd punishments. Therefore, if a Muslim man rapes a Muslim woman in the presence of women or non-Muslim men, he cannot be convicted under the Hudood Ordinances.

Page | 15 (https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Freedom_of_religion_in_Pakistan#Legal_and_personal_freedom_for_non-Muslims)

(Studies of crime in general reveal a strong correlation between patterns of misbehaviour, sexual or otherwise, and perceived risk, so these factors almost certainly must have an impact on who sexual predators target, regardless of other factors. Also see further down in the above article for more general issues with the 'Hudood' ordinances.)

Thus the girls' accounts of their experiences of sexual abuse and their parents reasons for fearing to go the police I find very credible, and they conform to what I have repeatedly come across in my work. Many Pakistani's generally, and Christians and other minorities in particular, will try and avoid the police – if not at all costs, then they will go to great lengths to avoid doing so if they can. Christians frequently have to bribe the police, and there is a quite high incidence of police torture and deaths in police custody. There is a steady stream of cases of Christians dying in police custody, often officially described as suicides or heart failures, but the bodies regularly bear signs of brutality and torture.

For a brief list of some incidents of police brutality against Christians, see the list and summary below. I will also place further details in an Annex on the subject at the end of this work. I should note that I have not chosen to put only the worst incidents in the annex, I leave them as a reasonable spread of severity. Some incidents that were really bad I have just summarized and not put in the Annex.

TTMOP p272 has an account of a prominent Christian journalist, politician and activist describing how he was tortured by Pakistani intelligence over his activities, and a colleague was tortured to death by the police.

TTMOP p290 refers to deaths and torture and other maltreatment, denial of medicine, and so on, for Christians in prison.

1999 TTMOP p308. Christians held by police and tortured for 1 month, leaving one permanently crippled, later jailed falsely due to personal grudge by policeman (see Annex)

September to November 2002 TTMOP p313 Four gunman attack Christian NGO, release Muslim workers, shoot seven Christian workers and beat another. Police arrest one of the other surviving eyewitnesses and torture him for a long time to gain a confession as an 'accomplice', as well as beating lawyers after the torture victim leaves court, police continuously threaten families of dead to get them to drop attempt for justice. (see Annex)

March and April 2003 TTMOP p314 Police torture to death illiterate janitor for allegedly stealing 300 heavy law books on his bike. Christian protest on death brutally put down, one Christian shot dead by police (see Annex)

August 2004 TTMOP p318 Christian accused of theft, tortured to death by police, 10 people accused of murder, including police, but never arrested.

November 2004 TTMOP p319-20 – Police brutality against a dissident Muslim and human rights activist including two weeks torture, 1 month denial of food, solitary confinement, refusal to tell family where he was. He and family converted to Christianity 2 years later.

Page | 16

November 2005 to January 2006 TTMOP p325 After blasphemy allegations against a Christian, police join in the rioting, arrest and torture four brothers of accused until he hands himself in to them (see Annex).

April 2006 TTMOP p328 Prison officials torture Christian inmate for holding bible study with fellow Christians.

March 2007 TTMOP p333, Christian accused of blasphemy, held for 3 years, nearly tortured to death by police, acquitted of all charges when case finally went to trial.

April 2007 TTMOP p334 Christian man arrested for blasphemy day before his marriage, tortured, his illiterate uncle arrested for alleged written blasphemy.

June 2007 TTMOP p336 Catholic prisoners put into isolation cells and tortured for bible studies and 'contaminating' glass by drinking from it

April 2008 TTMOP p341 Police torture Christian girl for alleged theft, also torture her brothers and elderly father (see Annex)

January 2009 TTMOP p349 Police raise false charges and brutally torture Christian man, including hanging him from the roof all night, beatings, breaking his spine and paralyzing him, brought further false charges to evade a court order to release him (see Annex).

June 2009 TTMOP p361 In the aftermath of the Gojra massacre of Christians, police arrest and torture Christians to get them to confess to receiving weapons from imaginary 'Christian religious terrorist groups'.

September 2009 TTMOP p362-4 Accusations of blasphemy against Christian man in relationship with Muslim woman. Pursuit and attack by Muslim extremists of family members of accused, but police then arrest victims, not attackers. Christians beaten, police do nothing to stop them, stop Christian NGO's and aid workers arriving, police arrest accused, tell father they are going to kill him, he is found hung in cell the next morning, police say is suicide, post-mortem indicates severe torture, police block Christian community from burying victim in local village, tear gas and shoot funeral procession, wounding three mourners, and tear gas alternative cemetery. (see Annex)

March 2010 TTMOP p371 Police torture confession of blasphemy charges out of Christian woman after dispute with Muslim customer. She is eventually acquitted, but family have to flee to hiding.

April 2010 TTMOP p376 Air Force Police beat and torture Christian resident for alleged theft, leaving her crippled, try and hide her injuries from courts.

July 2010 TTMOP p382-3 Two Christians including pastor accused of blasphemy and arrested, are shot dead outside court when looked like about to be acquitted, but post mortem shows they were tortured in custody.

Page | 17

November 2010 TTMOP p392 Case involving 'wrong-way' mixed marriage. Collusion by police with Islamicist groups such as the Taliban with both beating and torturing random Christian youths to try and torture location of eloped couple out of them. (See Annex)

January 2011 p393-4 6 Christian teenage boys in Karachi arrested by police and never seen again. In the final case, body is found with evidence of sodomization tortured, then shot with a police bullet. Police obstruct investigation, and threaten to kill or press charges against victims father and other Christians pressing for justice.

April 2011 P398-9 Allegations of police torture of several Christians including banker, his father, and priest in blasphemy allegations.

May 2011 p401 In yet another case of 'wrong-way' mixed marriage elopement, police torture a Christian girl to get the location of a Christian NGO's HQ, tip of extremist family and force evacuation of NGO HQ to avoid extremists torturing staff to get location of eloped Muslim girl.

November 2011 p413 After accusations of theft, only Christian servant (who is pregnant) is taken into custody and beaten and tortured severely by police for three days, released to family when close to death, loses baby

December 2011 p415-6 Police arrest and torture Christian man accused of blasphemy, using electric torture, and hanging him by feet from ceiling, although technical evidence later exonerates him.

June 2012 P 425 Two poor Christians refuse employers year long entreaty to convert, are accused of theft. Turn selves into police, relatives told would be beaten unless bribed, which family could not afford, two men severely tortured, one left crippled and unable to walk (see Annex).

September 2014 see final account in 'Wrong-way' mixed marriages annex

November 2014 <http://www.britishpakistanichristians.co.uk/blog/another-christian-man-has-been-killed-while-in-custody-on-blasphemy-charges> Christian man dies in police custody, family claim was tortured. ,

March 2015

<http://www.britishpakistanichristians.co.uk/blog/police-torture-to-death-son-of-ayesha-bibi-after-accusation-of-theft-from-home-where-she-was-domesti>

Christian servant accused of stealing by former employer, beaten by them, arrested, beaten by police, breaking her arms to try and gain confession. When this did not work, arrested her young son, and beat him in front of them and said would only stop if she confessed. She was later released, he was held overnight. Police car dumps his body outside their house early the next morning.

April 2015

<http://www.britishpakistanichristians.co.uk/blog/another-christian-killed-in-police-custody>

Christian man accused of theft of car batteries, police allege he took them to where he said he had stole them, then jumped in deep stream whilst handcuffed and drowned. Family said he was beaten and tortured from moment he was arrested in front of them, and they saw police push him handcuffed into stream, effectively drowning him. Police refused to help rescue or search for him in the stream.

Page | 18

7. In the light of this reality, it is common, the norm, perhaps, for Christian families to try as best they can for the males in their immediate and extended families to act as bodyguards / chaperones to accompany and protect as best they can the women in their families, especially those relatively young. This is a more probably a more urgent need in rural areas generally, but it is quite common for Christian families to feel the need for such procedures in urban areas too. This can create resentment (brothers unhappy that they can't play football or meet with friends because they have to accompany their sisters to and from school, etc) and in cases where there are not many male members of the extended family available for whatever reason, this can create immense practical difficulties – ongoing choices about whether to put the daughters of the family in a vulnerable position, or else severely restrict the ability of the males – often the primary breadwinners – to do their jobs and earn money. In cases where a great deal of the family has gone – fled abroad – and especially where there are few males, then the women are especially vulnerable, and from what I understand, both of these criteria apply to {...}, and even more so because, having been brought up in the West and having a desire to practice professions that could entail them moving about widely rather than conforming to Pakistani societies majority expectations that they will marry and raise children, this will make them especially vulnerable, in and of itself.

The account of the daughters trying to hide the reality of the sexual abuse and harassment from their parents very plausible, as this happens a lot, not just because of fear of what an angry father might do that could provoke a blasphemy accusation, but also because, in an honour-shame culture, they might wish to protect parents from the emotional fallout. For instance, in one fairly recent case, a Christian woman was forced by circumstance to tell her father about a rape she had suffered - the stress and shock was so great that he died of a heart attack on the spot (TTMOP p409).

c) Paragraphs on the sufferings of deportees from West, conversion as self-protection, and how official minority quotas reinforce subservient status, and Christian experience in universities

Page | 19

8. My most recent country report was for one such family on the continent who faced particular problems, in part because English was their family home language. Members of the extended family who had already been deported back to Pakistan were placed in such a bad situation that they felt compelled to at least make a show of publicly converting to Islam to survive, and the remaining family were afraid they would have to do the same or risk their lives. In other words, their ability to freely practice their religion was in practice non-existent.

9. Despite quota provisions for religious minorities in employment, it is in fact relatively rare for Christians to gain secure government employment with benefits, health care, holidays and the like. A significant proportion of quota jobs turn out to be sweepers who are denied civil service benefits, holiday rights, health care and the like by the ruse of keeping them as permanently temporary workers, bureaucratically fired just before the threshold of permanency and rights, and then rehired again the next day. This cycle will typically go on for generations, because, too poor to send children to school, they will go into the same line of work, and repeat the pattern. Thus it makes sense that a Christian family with such a secure job with benefits would be extremely reluctant to give it up and move to a new location where they would not have such job security. Whilst the {...} family are from the more professional or middle-class end of the Christian social spectrum, it is not that difficult for people in such a position to quickly descend into relative poverty that could bring them much nearer to the bottom end of the scale and its cycle of degradation. It is very normal for Christians to be denied jobs or fired for not converting to Islam. I repeatedly get reports and requests for help from Christians from the higher end of the social spectrum because they are given, to give one example, a salesman's job by large telecommunications companies. After a year running their own franchise-type operation very successfully, he was told that he was doing very well, but could not advance or be made a manager unless he converted to Islam. When he refused, he was fired. This is not at all untypical. Direct discrimination like this is rife in Pakistan.

10.I have supplied an annex documenting the experiences of several Christian girls who did manage to make it to university or top schools; one describes the prejudice, racism and scorn of her allegedly 'liberal' and tolerant elite classmates, and the other describes entering a war zone, being continually presented with subtle trick questions to assault her faith and urges fellow Christian students in Pakistan to stand up for their faith, because 'Death is coming to every one of us one day'.

d) *Paragraphs concerning targeting by extremist groups, religious apartheid, social conditions and general impracticalness of internal relocation*

Page | 20

11. If a Christian runs into some kind of trouble and attracts attention from the ever-burgeoning and influential extremist groups, then their situation can vary. Sometimes it is just down to luck, or whether local extremist groups have a successful confluence of interests with local influential people. But even going back two decades ago, extremist groups can be *exceedingly* persistent in tracking down people and harassing them. In one case a family were tracked and harassed across multiple cities even after the persecution had forced them to break up and they themselves had lost contact with each other. However, my perception is that this kind of hounding has grown more common and much easier for several somewhat interconnected reasons:

- a) the increase in influence and reach of various extremist groups, who can work together even if they are sometimes hostile, if a case is deemed to have sufficiently insulted the deemed proper Islamic order
- b) the increasing radicalization of Pakistani society as a whole, resulting in more potential supporters they can tap for information – whether in the police force or in local or national government administration.
- c) the rise of mobile communications technology: a person’s photo can be easily obtained, and spread to affiliate groups of extremist supporters in regions where the targets are suspected to have fled (usually because it is a larger Christian community to which Christians would naturally flee, or to an area where family or close friends are known to reside and to which targets would also naturally prefer to flee to if possible) along with the message that these people who have affronted the Islamic faith in some way.

12. Being deemed to have affronted Islam can simply be a matter of standing up for justice in cases where Christians have been raped or denied justice in some way. I find that often the best way to understand this dynamic is to compare the attitudes towards Christians in Pakistan with those of the pre-Civil Rights era towards African-Americans. Christians in Pakistan are often known as ‘dirty sweepers’ who should keep to and know their place. In some places in Pakistan, there are separate drinking water fountains for Muslims and non-Muslims, and woe betide a non-Muslim who drinks out of a Muslim water supply, as Asia Bibi found to her cost and thus has been on death row for the last half a decade. The following Wikipedia link succinctly describes the trigger event for her arrest - https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Asia_Bibi_blasphemy_case#Background_and_arrest . For other cases in which Hindu’s and Christians have been attacked for, or prevented from, drinking from ‘Muslim’ water sources, see TTMOP p116, p317, p366, p386. In both the case of pre-60’s African Americans and present-day Pakistani Christians, while there can seem to be some peace and calm, step out of line and things can get very nasty very quickly, and standing up for basic rights or even just being more successful than most of the Muslim majority can be deemed stepping out of line (Islam is deemed to be the superior religion, so anyone not conforming to that reality is affronting that aspect of the Islamic worldview – and those who most strongly hold that world view are the extremist groups most likely to do something about it).

13. Like any society, those who are deemed outsiders or ‘liminal’ – crossing boundaries – will be far more likely to attract adverse attention and persecution. This is why those who stand up for their

rights and cross those 'lines' in the last paragraph attract particular attention and brutality. Christian human rights workers in Pakistan are frequently targeted, both because they are Christian and because they are human rights workers. For many Pakistani Christians, they have learned simply to knuckle under to survive, as did African Americans prior to the 1960's. They have become enculturated to their situation. Christian parents often teach their children from a very young age never to bring up their faith, and deflect any kind of religious interfaith questions if asked, because they are deathly afraid of accusations of blasphemy if their children are deemed to have gone too far in defending their faith or their religion'. Christian women are often habituated to the sexual abuse they receive. In some rural communities, it appears that the whole female Christian population are in effect kept as sex-slaves while their men work in their fields, and they are powerless to do anything about it (see TTMOP p378-9, but also an account in the Annex on sexual abuse of Christian women below). In the light of this, someone coming back from being brought up in the Western culture will stand out like a sore thumb and become a target, or will have to bite their lips and remain silent (and may still become a target because their different worldview may still come out and be perceived as liminal / boundary-crossing anyway).

14. Naturally, this brings up the issue of internal relocation, aspects of which I have already touched upon in paragraph 11 above. It can just be possible to successfully relocate internally, but it is increasingly difficult and I am not nearly so sanguine about it as the decision makers in this case. In several cases I have dealt with, Christian families or individuals have tried to relocate internally several times, and their persecutors have caught up with them in a matter of days to weeks. As I have said earlier, in a situation like Pakistan, Christians will want to try and stay where they have some sort of support network, and so the places they can go to whilst maintaining such networks is limited, and the extremists know this very well and so such places are the first places they will look. Relatives locations are virtually never a secret on a wider community level, and the major Christian suburbs in cities are not that great, fairly few, and well-known. Seeking a new start outside such support networks is fraught with difficulties. A new person moving into an area without such community or family connections and who does not go to mosque might reasonably be suspected to be a Christian or minority person fleeing trouble, so questions can be asked on the Islamic groups and Islamicist mosques network, even if there is not an active pursuit from their place of origin. To avoid risk, such people may take jobs well below their skill level and for little pay. If they cannot work, and have no connections, then they can quickly run out of cash and options, and have to take more desperate and risky measure to survive or live in extreme poverty.

e) Paragraphs on sufficiency of protection issues around Christians, especially women, as well as the weakness of arguments around police professionalism improvements

Page | 22

15. This then brings us on to the matter of sufficiency of protection. The decision makers... often ... cite the case of AW (sufficiency of protection) Pakistan 2011 UKUT 31 (IAC), saying that there is not a 'general insufficiency of state protection', but that individual circumstances should be considered. {Even the documentary background evidence the decision maker quoted about police complaints procedures show severe problems} they openly state that even though a Police complaints procedure was enshrined in law in 2002, in practice, 8 years later, very few of the complaints commissions had been set up, and that they have 'little impact', their decisions are not binding, and they are largely ignored because they have no 'teeth'. ... talks about seeking redress for human rights violations through the courts, but that the civil courts 'seldom, if ever, issued official judgments in such cases, and most cases were settled out of court...informal reparations were common'. I have no idea how, or even if, the situation has changed since 2011, but I certainly can't recall hearing of any case involving Christians gaining redress through such processes in since then.

If this is true in general, then the situation for Christians is worse. They are frequently without funds, reliant on borrowing or aid or NGO's in such cases. Not only that, but the 'informal reparations' route is always or nearly always used in discriminatory fashion against Christians. Police will often go for 'community solutions', but given the power imbalance, Christians loose out. Indeed, certain imams have been known to instigate violence and unrest against churches, wait for the police to call for such 'reconciliation meetings' and then use them to enforce their will on churches (to stop them having prayer meetings at the time of Muslim prayers, for instance). On the level of individual Christians seeking redress after rape or violence, the perpetrators are usually richer, Muslim, and more powerful, and it is the norm rather than the exception that they will pressure families to drop charges in favour of 'reconciliation' – usually relatively small amounts of money, but large for impoverished Christians, accompanied by threats of violence or blasphemy allegations, or sometimes use of actual violence. This is hardly 'sufficiency of protection'.

16. I notice that in the case of R (Bagdanavicius) v Secretary of State for the Home Department (Court of Appeal 2005) which is frequently referred to, the issue of sufficiency of protection is partially covered as follows:

- 3) Fear of persecution is well-founded if there is a "reasonable degree of likelihood" that it will materialise;
- 4) Sufficiency of state protection, whether from state agents or non-state actors, means a willingness and ability on the part of the receiving state to provide through its legal system a reasonable level of protection from ill treatment of which the claimant for asylum has a well-founded fear;
- 5) The effectiveness of the system provided is to be judged normally by its systemic ability to deter and/or to prevent the form of persecution of which there is a risk, not just punishment of it after the event;
- 6) Notwithstanding systemic sufficiency of state protection in the receiving state, a claimant may still have a well-founded fear of persecution if he can show that its authorities know or

ought to know of circumstances particular to his case giving rise to his fear, but are unlikely to provide the additional protection his particular circumstances reasonably require;

Using this as guide, combined with my knowledge, I wish to make the following observations:

Page | 23

3) There is a reasonable degree of likelihood in Pakistan that Christian women will face high levels of sexual harassment.

4) It is very common for police to refuse to register cases if Christians in particular go to make a complaint about such behaviour, and even if they do, common for them not to pursue the case with any vigour, particularly when, as is often case, the perpetrators come from influential local families. This is the reason why Christians often don't even bother to go the police (and many Muslim citizens also share that attitude to some degree). This calls into question the willingness and / or ability of the state to provide reasonable levels of protection.

5) Given that it is common for multiple forces to 'encourage' Christian victims of these and other crimes to go down the discriminatory 'informal' route, and this is well known in Pakistan, not only does the Pakistani justice system seem systemically unable to deter and prevent such persecution, it can arguably be said to actually encourage it, if not in some cases participate in and further such persecution.

6) These problems are widespread and well known, and the authorities do know that Christians are targeted in this way, and do not appear (see below) to be able or willing to tackle it effectively. Indeed, some state agents appear to be complicit in actively encouraging it, whilst a good many others share the general populations antipathy towards Christians.

17. Like a good many other rejection decisions I have seen, the decision makers cite a 9 August 2013 country of Origin report for Pakistan, which notes improvements to police forces professionalism, as follows:

There were improvements in police professionalism during the year. As in previous years, the Punjab provincial government conducted regular training in technical skills and protection of human rights for police at all levels. During the year police were active in thwarting attempts by protestors to reach foreign embassy property during protests against a film that protesters believed defamed the Prophet Muhammad. Unlike in previous years, police did not indiscriminately fire lethal weapons into the crowd.

However, I would like to point out that it is inappropriate to use this rather weak reasoning in the case of Christians, for the following reasons:

- a) Improvements in police training do not necessarily result in improvements on the ground, particularly when the police force tends to share the general antipathy and discriminatory attitudes towards Christians, and
- b) The sole evidence of this alleged 'improved professionalism' involves one particular incident where police did not fire indiscriminately into the crowd. However, this was a protest about the allegedly Christian-made 'Innocence of Muslims' short film, in which

we would expect many of the Muslim police to sympathise with their fellow Muslim protestors.

- c) This was a large scale event in the eye of the international media with massed police forces. The discrimination Christians face from the police is almost entirely out of sight, at local police station and sub-station level where the dynamics are very different.

Page | 24

As far as I can tell, these kind of approaches were Christians face discrimination at police level is prevalent across all areas of Pakistan. My organisation has given symbolic presents such as flowers to Pakistani police where they have acted well and honourably, and I believe you could easily count such incidents on hand. Police who do try to act rightly are often constrained and undermined by colleagues who think differently. Thus Christians can be, and usually are, discriminated against at varying stages of the process. I would also like to quote a relevant section from my most recent report (case in progress either in Denmark, or with the UN) which has a bearing on this issue:

A recent incident involving riots against Christian families and neighbourhoods following an alleged blasphemy seemed to show greater even-handedness and professionalism on the part of the police who confronted the mobs, but again, this is just one incident, and more telling is the revelation, from the mouths of their own spokesmen, as to why they acted differently - 'Enough is enough! Such incidents tarnish the image of our country. The Zimbabwean cricket team was touring the country and we could not afford any disturbance like this.' (See <https://www.worldwatchmonitor.org/2015/06/3878289/>) In other words, this was only window-dressing – there is only apparent 'professionalism' and better treatment of Christians when the world is believed to be watching or likely to take note, which does not bode well for Christians future, since such incidents are common and usually go under the radar of the international community and press.

Additionally, that account gives a vivid description of such typical mob action. They will target Christians in general, but given the huge antipathy towards the west, {...} will likely be even more of a target for this kind of mob-action.

This was a case involving the {...} but the same is also true of Christians who have been brought up in the West and imbibed Western cultural values.

f) *Detailed critique of recent Country Guidance : [2014] UKUT 569 AK & SK (Christians: risk) (CG).*

To see the paragraphs I am referring to, you can download copies of the original court case and guidance here - <https://tribunalsdecisions.service.gov.uk/utiac/2014-ukut-569>

Page | 25

18. I have also been asked to comment on some aspects of the recent Christian country guidance in the case [2014] UKUT 569 AK & SK (Christians: risk) (CG). I have touched on some of the points without direct referencing in the article, but I will here lay them out separately.

a) Paragraphs 207 and 210 stating that greater numbers of blasphemy allegations are made against Ahmahdis and mainstream Muslims. My understanding is that this is true of Ahmahdis, but the assertions about ‘mainstream Muslims’ can only be true in terms of absolute numbers, but not in terms of per-head of population. Non-Ahmahdi religious minorities are far more likely to be charged with blasphemy. In TTMOP p283 I examined the statistics for official blasphemy cases, and ran them against varying estimates of the Christian population of Pakistan as a percentage to get approximations of how likely you were to be formally accused of blasphemy as a ‘mainstream Muslim’ and as a Christian, or religious minority. I used estimates ranging from the official CIA handbook and Pakistani government figures (but see TTPMO p267 -269 for reasons why these are certain to be underestimates) and the more wildly optimistic estimates from Christian sources. Even using the highest estimates of Christians and non-Muslim minorities (not including Ahmahdis) such minorities are three times as likely as the main populace to be accused. If we take the highest (and wildest) estimates of the Christian population, then Christians and Hindu’s are about equally likely to be accused as each other. If we take the official government population statistics, then Christians are ten times as likely as Hindu’s to be accused of blasphemy. For a little more detail, please see the Annex on ‘Religion and Blasphemy accusations.

b) Even just using stats does not convey the true picture. One of the reasons that Christians and other minorities are so afraid of blasphemy charges and accusations – aside from the chance of being lynched and whole communities attacked – is that of the loss of a breadwinner. Typically, blasphemy cases involve long waits for the initial case where the lower court will probably be intimidated by Islamicists and find the accused guilty, there will then be several years with an appeals process before higher courts (hopefully) overturn the sentence. Now a mainstream Muslim accused of blasphemy will have a pretty good chance of getting bail. Christians and other minorities chance of getting bail is slim to none. It was amazing good news when one Christian last year was granted bail. Since the accused is very often the primary bread-winner in the family, years in bail and in jail during the appeals process has a very great and deleterious effect. The attempts made by the government to counter abuses of the law through the 2004 amendment to the penal code are not very effective in view of the continued abuse of these laws, and whilst it is good that the high court’s ‘invariably overturn cases of wrongful convictions’ the suffering caused by the extreme length of time taken to get to that stage gives advantage to the persecutors as they can rely on their targets and their targets families suffering, and then also suffering ongoing poverty effects after the eventual release from prison. I cannot recall any case where the perpetrators of false charges against Christians were in any way punished. Even in the recent case of Rimsha Masih, a young Christian girl accused of blasphemy, although the mosque prayer leader who accused her – and appears to have fabricated evidence – was arrested and charged, intense pressure meant that the charges were dropped (for more on the case, and the intense pressures involved at various stages of

the trial – see TTMOP p274-5, p285, end of top paragraph and p291; for contemporary newspaper reports on release of cleric – see <http://www.ibtimes.com.au/rimsha-masih-blasphemy-case-pakistan-court-acquits-imam-chishti-1315202> , <http://www.dawn.com/news/756161/imam-in-rimsha-masih-blasphemy-case-released> and <http://tribune.com.pk/story/591445/rimsha-case-cleric-khalid-chisti-acquitted/>).

Page | 26

c) In paragraph 210 the judges claim that ‘the evidence demonstrates that the vast majority of Muslim minorities living in Pakistan and that it is a very small number who seek to target them. While there is perhaps some truth to this, I would argue that it vastly overstates the ‘moderation / toleration level’ in Pakistan. I suspect that part of the reason for this is the constant low-level denigration and discrimination against Christians that is participated in by the majority of Pakistani society to a considerable degree. It ignores the sudden change in dynamic when blasphemy accusations are made, typically from mosque loudspeakers. When there is persecution involved, Christians report that Muslim friends are afraid to do anything to speak out, since extremists will gladly target Muslims who they deem to be ‘against Islam’ in some way. By way of comparison, it is instructive to look at the example of places like Syria and Iraq, where Christians are reporting that when ISIS arrives, suddenly they are finding that their Muslim neighbours and friends, whose children they looked after and supported, actively engage in atrocities like rape and murder. This kind of dynamic has happened in Pakistan too. I think in particular of the horrific 1997 attack on the Salvation Army village of Shanti Nagar (see TTMOP p304-6, extracts in Annex) in 1997 which left the villagers so shocked and traumatized that many members were suffering extreme psychological trauma over a decade a half later. It is also instructive because the initial sparking incident involved a pattern of persecution and provocation by the police. There have been other more recent incidents that were perhaps less dramatic or largescale, but followed the same pattern – relations that on the surface seemed good being overturned in an instant, with elements of economic warfare. For instance there were several incidents of this type in the period June to August 2009 (see TTMOP p356-7, p359-60). I suggest that had someone gone by reports of, say the early 20th Century US south, they could just as easily have said that the white population was generally tolerant of their Negro minority, and relations were generally good, but that was only the case if the blacks *knew and kept to their place*. The same applies here.

In the recent 2015 double suicide bombing and gun attack at two large churches simultaneously in the area repeatedly called by decision makers a ‘safe area’ for Christians (Youhanabad) that resulted in at least 100 dead or injured, what was particularly concerning was not just the suicide bomb attack, but what happened in the aftermath. There was greater concern about the death of terrorist accomplices than the Christian victims across both the government and media. There was repeated incitement against Christians not just from mosques, but by mainstream media, and even by government officials. There had been threats against the churches for three months, and ongoing incitement by several local mosques, but the police had repeatedly refused additional security measures, and the only reason the death toll was not higher was because the churches own makeshift security forces had managed to stop the bombers getting in to the main buildings by physically grappling with them and died in the process. In the aftermath there were repeated threats against churches all across Lahore city and beyond, with police using local mosque loudspeakers to warn of the dangers of attacks and to take measures to defend themselves. Police arrested 250 Christian young men, regardless of their involvement in any criminal activity, as well as targeting Christian rights activists. They were also sexually harassing Christian women and beating

up anyone with a cross. As is normal in even much lesser attacks, Christians fled their homes, leaving them locked and padlocked, hoping to escape anticipated mob attacks, which are frequent in cases of blasphemy and other occasions when mosques and other forces stir up hatred against Christians. Work by Christian leaders did eventually mean that the situation became less volatile, police were demanding bribes for the release of innocent Christians they had arrested, and disturbingly, they called it a religious Jizya tax for the 'sin' of the Christian community allegedly killing innocent Muslims. In the month after the attacks, there were gun attacks on a nearby Christian school, and also a case where a Christian teenage boy was beaten and burned alive simply for being a Christian – which happened, not in a remote village, but in the Lahore metropolis. (6 months earlier a young Christian couple with five children were similarly beaten and burned alive in the work place, in a remote village). In addition Christian victims of the bombings were abruptly discharged from hospital because they couldn't pay, still with shrapnel and ball bearings in their body. Whilst some of the arrested Christians who were innocent of wrongdoing were released, those released reported brutal torture – the police tore fingernails out, slammed them against walls and kicked and hit them ferociously, and many of those released fled Lahore, afraid of reprisals or re-arrest. Fathers were arrested and beaten until their sons handed themselves in to save them, girls and women were molested before, after and during arrests. Police officers repeatedly visited girls and women offering to get men released in return for sexual 'favours'. For what is worth, there were calls for attacks on Pakistani Christian organizations and churches across the world, and even we at the BPCA received Facebook threats from someone claiming to be a Pakistani member of the group Anonymous, calling on all hackers to wage war on us, equating us with Pakistani Islamic terrorist groups. Documentation of all the above are in the links below.

<http://www.britishpakistanichristians.co.uk/blog/lahore-twin-church-bombing-update>

<http://www.britishpakistanichristians.co.uk/blog/pakistani-christians-need-your-prayer-and-support-now-more-than-ever>

<http://www.britishpakistanichristians.co.uk/blog/lahore-christians-fear-muslim-mob-attack-after-series-of-threats-received-by-all-churches>

<http://www.britishpakistanichristians.co.uk/blog/relief-aid-for-victims-of-lahore-bomb-attack-starts-in-earnest>

<http://www.britishpakistanichristians.co.uk/blog/christians-complain-about-forced-police-jizya-tax-in-retribution-for-killing-of-two-muslim-men>

<http://www.britishpakistanichristians.co.uk/blog/family-of-nouman-masih-rip-speak-of-the-great-solace-they-have-knowing-he-is-in-heaven-in-a-place-wi>

<http://www.britishpakistanichristians.co.uk/blog/another-attack-on-christians-in-lahore-leave>

<http://www.britishpakistanichristians.co.uk/blog/lahore-bomb-victims-revisited>

<http://www.britishpakistanichristians.co.uk/blog/christian-men-arrested-in-lahore-riots-flee-home-town>

My only observation of this is that I have worked with a genocide expert, and know that many of the elements that are said to denote genocide are present in these events – including deliberate targeting and marking out of minority victims with authority (and in this case, media) complicity.

Page | 28

d) In paragraph 210, the bit about rural poor unlikely to be the targets of ‘land-grabbing’ is mostly true. However, poor Christians tend to be generous to the very limit of their means, and there have been several incidents of impoverished Christians banding together and saving money to buy land to build churches or orphanages or schools and having the ‘land mafia’ grab them. Christian graveyards are also a fairly frequent target (see i) below for more, also for specific incidents TTMOP p 321, 331, 339, 373, 386, 392).

e) I broadly agree with paragraph 211, but note that just the fear or potential for a threat of blasphemy is a potent weapon and leverage in and of itself, and it is used often.

f) Paragraph 214 about the relatively affluent members of religious minorities in urban areas being generally left alone is not really true. More affluent Christians in urban areas are quite frequently targeted, and sometimes it is their affluence, especially if they are doing well compared to their peers, that makes them a target precisely because they are affluent minorities from ‘inferior’ religions but being perceived as having a superior status. Bankers, teachers and others in such positions do get targeted in some towns, and do to their resources, these are a group most likely to be able to flee to the West, so will probably be relatively highly represented in cases presented to UK authorities. It is, however, certainly true that the rural poor generally suffer the most.

g) Prominent Christians provide good examples of ‘religious pluralism’ to the state, but even these can face problems, particularly in politics, as the recent case of a politician reduced to begging his opponents in tears to stop pursuing actions that would likely have resulted in him being killed because of an administrative error on his official record from birth. In addition, although there are reserved seats for minority voters, they are not really free – individual Muslim dominated parties select such members, so they are beholden more to their political masters than their constituents, which is why there has been a long-running, but so far unfruitful campaign to change under the slogan ‘Election, not selection’.

h) Paragraph 217. It is certainly true that Christians have greater freedom than the Ahmahdis and that there are a number of Christian churches, hospitals and schools, and officially the building of churches is allowed. They can also wear crosses etc. However, there is a difference between what is legally permissible and socially permissible. Traditionally, Christian schools and hospitals have been the best, and for this reason the elite like to use them, resulting in some protection. However, there have been a number of attempts to illegally take over Christian hospitals by powerful Muslim businessmen, and there also have been examples of church property being illegally taken over. The most recent one I am aware of was in Taxila, near the capital Islamabad and happened in July 2011 (TTMOP p405). The claim that there is little evidence that Christian activists or organisations have been targeted is false. There is much that goes on under the radar of Western media and bodies (for examples between 2005 and 2012, see TTMOP pages 323, 344, 347, 357-9, 392, 401, 419, and 429). There are also more recent attacks on Christian activists and NGO’s, for instance a shooting in August 2014 - <http://www.britishpakistanichristians.co.uk/blog/guns-shot-at-home-of-christian-human-right-defender> and in the case of two gang-rape victims we at the BPCA are seeking justice for, criminals linked to the rapists have repeatedly pressurized the brother of the advocate taking

the case forward to compromise, offering bribes to influence the case, and when he refused repeatedly, he was shot in April 2015 - <http://www.britishpakistanichristians.co.uk/blog/brother-of-advocate-mushtaq-shot-twice-for-refusing-bribe-in-Sherish-and-Farzana-case> .

Page | 29

I have noted a number of attacks on churches in the main body of the article; the list is by no means exhaustive. There is a good reason why many churches, even relatively poor ones, feel the need to hire guards or semi-automatic weapons to guard their church services and prayer meetings. Official police protection, even when it is given, is poor and anaemic, and it is remarkable the number of times they just happen not to be there when attacks occur, the recent double suicide church bombings being an example – the police were in nearby tea-houses watching cricket, and it was the members of the church that managed to prevent the bombers getting in to the main services. This is not to say that policeman haven't bravely stood their ground and been murdered or wounded protecting churches – they have – but in practice state protection is just not reliable, by and large, and the churches well know this. As I have said in the main report, there are many incidents of intimidation of Christian workers and pastors that do not make the news, even when it involves Taliban shooting guns and using loudspeakers to harass and intimidate Christian pastors inside their family homes. I have been talking to such pastors on Facebook whilst such incidents have been ongoing, and hear of several others. I should also note that the recent double suicide bombing of two churches was in the very Youhanabad colony that is supposed to be the 'safe place' for Christians go to, and is sometimes mentioned by name in decision makers talking about internal relocation. I have also dealt with cases of attempted kidnap of Christians who had already relocated there.

i) The judge may not have seen reports of the desecration of Christian graveyards, but I most certainly have (see for instance TTMOP p298 for the issue generally, and for some specific incidents p 321, 392, 402 and 423).

j) Paragraph 218 on interfaith marriages. I disagree with the judges conclusions, as the court clearly did not have available to it the relevant material and evidence available to him. Marriage specifically between a Muslim man and a Christian woman is permitted, as is standard in Islamic countries. This is because the male is deemed the superior, the dominant one, so a Muslim man marrying a Christian woman keeps the Islamic order, whereas the opposite is an affront to the Islamic order and superiority. This is precisely *why* the couple mentioned eloped in 2010 – because they knew full well that a marriage between a Christian male and a Muslim girl would not be accepted and result in severe societal consequences, which it did. There was no marriage. For more on this incident and the aftermath the judge has missed, see <http://www.southasianrights.org/wp-content/uploads/2011/06/Status-of-Minorities-Pakistan-2010.pdf> . The landlord, the girls father, illegally detained 43 members of the boys extended family, threatening to kill all of them unless the eloped girl returned to the family. For an account of a similar incident in May 2011, see TTMOP p401 and on the same incident and the all too typical police inaction see <http://www.pakistanchristianpost.com/headlinenewsd.php?hnewsid=2879> . There was another incident in September 2012 – it is very instructive to read the account at <http://tribune.com.pk/story/444262/honour-at-stake-love-in-the-time-of-blasphemy/> as it contains a number of elements that vividly show the ongoing below the radar discrimination and persecution Christians face, including threats from the Muslims, and notice also that when the impoverished Christian family protest that they cannot afford the search for the eloped couple the Muslims

demand, the Muslims unilaterally seized the family cow, and sold it, but kept two thirds of the price and gave the family only a third to conduct the enforced search. Such extortion and robbery is very typical. In short, due to lack of knowledge, the judge has very seriously misrepresented the position here, and painted a picture totally contrary to the facts on the ground. I have included relevant material from these links in an Annex on 'Wrong Way' Mixed Marriages. They also contain accounts of an illegal police raid targeting a Christian NGO, and the way extreme pressure is exerted including threats to kill, stealing and illegal disposal of Christian property and the like.

Page | 30

k) Paragraph 219 around textbooks. The judge seems ignorant of the following (TTMOP p300) :

'A recent study on behalf of a US government body looked at both textbooks and student and teacher attitudes (across both Madrassas and other schools). Among its findings were that all teachers surveyed thought of Jihad as violent struggle and as obligatory, many thought that animosity towards religious minorities was justified due to their 'blasphemy', and that they had mixed and confused views about minorities rights and place in society. It also found that although comparative religion was not on the official curriculum, many of them introduced it into classes, specifically to 'prove' the superiority of Islam over other religions, thus contributing significantly to a hostile environment for Christians and other minorities. Admittedly, most tend to view 'Children of the Book' (i.e. Christians and Jews) better than other religious minorities, but still, the attitudes conveyed were hostile. About 40% believed that minorities were not equal citizens (or could not be citizens at all). 80% considered all non-Muslims enemies of Islam, but a good many advocated kindness to non-Muslims in school, if only in the hope of them converting to Islam. These attitudes were reflected in the students surveyed as well.

Of the textbooks surveyed, there were few neutral or positive depictions of minorities, and a great many hostile ones. A great deal of discrimination was done by omission – not studying non-Muslim Pakistani writers, and ignoring the contributions of religious minorities in the history and culture of Pakistan. There was a lot of derogatory, and sometimes quite frankly, inaccurate material about other religions – for example claims about changes and perversions in core Christian doctrine. There was also a strong sense conveyed of 'threat to Islam' which creates an ominous and oppressive atmosphere against non-Muslims. In addition, Islamic studies is compulsory, and, similar to the situation in prisons, students who memorize the Quran get a significant number of extra marks in their exam grades.

Perhaps the effect of all this can be best illustrated by an incident where a Muslim head-teacher was reading from a text-book which said 'We are Pakistanis and all of us are Muslims'. An 11 year old Christian girl said that she was a Christian, but was also a Pakistani, and at this the teacher flew into a rage and started thrashing her, shouting 'All Pakistanis are Muslims. You are not a Pakistani if you are a Christian! If you are a Christian, your homeland is in Europe or in America!'

l) Paragraph 222. This is broadly correct. However, regarding why the reserved representation in politics remains problematic, see sub paragraph g) above, and why the 5% reserved jobs for Christians masks a reality wherein discrimination persists, see paragraph 9. In fact, I think that quoting in full the relevant sections from TTMOP is useful here, firstly on the issue of what the true

percentage of Christians in the country is and why the official figures are highly suspect and almost certain to be drastically low:

....here is a summary of Bhatti's arguments. He says that at Independence, Christians accounted for 3% of the population. However, he says that at the time of Independence, a good proportion of other religious minorities in Pakistan converted to Christianity. He goes through each province, giving relevant percentages of minority populations converting to Christianity. In addition he claims that census taking in Pakistan is a very corrupt, distorted and shoddy process. Feudal lords and tribal chiefs manipulated the figures to get more representation at local and provincial governmental bodies – something he said was later admitted by many of them in articles and interviews. As Christians never had any influence in government, they were sidelined. He also said that census figures for Christians were not taken in the field but done in government offices. Some Christians in Pakistan have names that are identifiably Christian – the surname Masih, and Western names. Bhatti maintains that about 60% of the Christian population has names indistinguishable from the Muslim majority population, and that the census takers simply and routinely number these as Muslim. As evidence of the massively higher figures he says are correct, he cites the 2002 snapshot taken by the Roman Catholic church in Pakistan, which is by far the biggest single Christian denomination in Pakistan. Despite a 30% decline in numbers, largely due to other Christian denominations evangelizing (or poaching, depending on your point of view), the Catholic church declared close to 13 million across their rolls in the archbishoprics. That would roughly equate to 7% of Pakistani citizens. A further factor is that the official percentages have remained about the same right through, and didn't change when East Pakistan (Bangladesh) was removed from the equation due to independence in 1971 – Bangladesh having a tiny Christian population (around 0.3%). He says that alone should have meant the figures jumped to about 10%. He also notes that when the overall number of seats in the General assembly was increased, the proportion of Christian seats did not increase in line with the general increase. He thinks that the motivation for this is that the increasingly Islamicized Pakistani government wants to disenfranchise and minimize its Christian minority religion (presumably Christians more than any other religion, because they are a chief rival to Islam in that they, unlike Hindus, are a missionary faith). He says the government adopted measures to keep Christians away from democratic institutions, and that when he repeatedly offered to take a census of Christians at no cost, using volunteers – be it a general census, or sample or spot census' in particular locales or cities – the government has always refused.

One other factor might be that the church records include converts from Islam, whom the census might take as Muslims. Indeed, out of fear of being killed, secret converts might declare themselves to be Muslims and – as we shall see later – it is well-nigh impossible to change your ID on the ID system from Muslim, even if it was simply an error. This is a very sensitive area as the Christian faith requires Christians to evangelize, but converting Muslims can mean death at the hands of an angry mob. Some church reports say there are virtually no conversions to Christianity, whereas others report in vague terms significant interest in conversion. (TTMOP p268-9)

And on the way the 5% job quotas work in practice:

There are a number of other discriminatory practices against Christians and other minorities, even in the very things that are meant to ameliorate that discrimination. This is most evident in the 5% quota in government jobs for religious minorities. This is supposed to be a way of getting bright minority youngsters into responsible and well paid jobs, but in actual fact experience shows that the 'government jobs' that graduates are given are simply sanitation positions – in other words the minorities quotas are a sham and just perpetuate the minorities status as 'sweepers', worth nothing more. The deception has caught several university graduates out, as they seek job security as opposed to risky private jobs. In some cases, it means these graduates despair of educating their children because education seems pointless – you just end up in the same degrading jobs. Illiterate Muslims are sometimes appointed to jobs where literacy is fundamental to the job skills needed, but graduates from minorities are trashed. In employment areas where Christians traditionally predominate, there tends to be a dichotomy – in health care, for instance, the nurses tend to be young Christian women, but the doctors Muslims, and has given rise to an unknown but certainly very high level of sexual abuse against Christian nurses. (TTMOP p290)

The situation in 2015 is well described here:

<http://www.britishpakistanichristians.co.uk/blog/minority-5-recruitment-quota-still-ignored-despite-constitutional-reform-in-2009>

Since September 2009, all government departments have been bound by constitutional decree to implement a set 5 quota for religious minorities when recruiting, but a member of the selection committee in this case appointed his own son. Mr Ashraf said that the Department was prejudiced against him because he is a Christian and also alleged that the department gave the wrong information to the selection committee, mixing his application with another candidate's. Mr Justice Qasam Khan adjourned this employment discrimination case until 2nd April 2015.

With the BPCA's support LEAD has, in many cases like this, taken the officials concerned to the provincial ombudsman of Punjab and they have also filed petitions in the Higher Courts when these employment measures have not been implemented, but despite this the respective departments continue to flout the law.

Advocate Sardar Mushtaq Gill, Human Rights Defender, said:

"Minorities who initially welcomed the measure are deeply disappointed over non-implementation of the five percent job quota for minorities." He went on to describe the beneficiaries of the job quota as : "no more than a drop in the ocean" because of religious prejudice and discrimination.

There have been complaints that some Government departments are deliberately not advertising these jobs to minorities because they are operating from a platform of religious prejudice and discrimination. The prevailing attitude being that minorities such as Christians should only be entitled to do menial work. This institutional prejudice ensures that Christians and other minorities are being kept in poverty and servitude.

m) Paragraph 224 on Christians who speak out about their faith and evangelize being more prone to being targeted. This is broadly correct. However, I should point out that even having Christian materials, books, etc in private dwellings can make you a target, and sometimes activities within churches. For instance, I recall incidents in which a visiting preacher in a prayer meeting was targeted because of his exposition of a passage from 1 Corinthians, and typically, the whole local Christian community was held liable and culpable for his preaching of the bible (see TTMOP p423 – May 2012). It should also be noted that given the high poverty, drug abuse and the like in many Christian slums, Christian evangelism is often outreach to these nominal Christians, but even that has very occasionally been known to arouse ire. I can recall one such incident, but cannot find the documentation.

n) Paragraph 226 about incidents where authorities offered protection and redress. These incidents happened, but there are plenty more when the authorities don't offer such protection. In addition, whilst I do not know for sure the ultimate outcome of the rebuilding after the 2013 incident was, but I do know that after international media interest moved on, local Christians reported that the assistance slowed or dried up altogether. This is not at all uncommon. The authorities put on these shows when international interest is on particular incidents, and then reneges and hopes matters will continue as they were under the radar. This also then has the later effect, as here, that immediately available evidence to judges and decision makers causes them to perceive the situation in Pakistan is better for Christians than it really is.

o) Paragraphs 227 to 231 on blasphemy charges and internal relocation. I would broadly agree – blasphemy charges are pursued with widely varying degrees of vigour, but in my experience, decision makers have thus far routinely touted this option when it is relatively unrealistic, and I hope that this new guidance results in improved initial decision making in this area, but we shall see. I haven't seen any cases since this ruling came into effect, so cannot comment further.

p) Paragraphs 235 to 239: These I would broadly agree with, but I would like to make several comments. It is indeed difficult to judge between widely varying figures, but I tend to take the 2010 Asian Human Rights Commission as probably the most accurate. There is a thriving sex-slave trade industry in Pakistan, and where such sex-slaves are rescued, they report being kept for decades in some cases. Given that vulnerable minorities are especially targeted because of their weak position, and because families are often intimidated against pressing charges by the perpetrators and police (there are unconfirmed but persistent reports that several quite senior politicians are involved in the trade), I should expect that the disparity between say, the individual cases that we get in, and the actual number of cases to be explainable on such grounds, which is why I tend to accept the 2010 figures of about 700 Christian girls or women a year, despite actually coming across reports of fewer cases. Additionally, even though the situation is doubtless better for more affluent urban Christian women, yet the practice of escorts for such females indicate some need, and such women still report high levels of harassment. Urban poor who work as maids still experience high levels of sexual abuse, slave conditions, and violence. One example of this was the brutal and ongoing incarceration, torture, starvation and sexual abuse and murder of a young Christian girl by an *extremely* senior Muslim lawyer four or five years ago. He got away with it, and indeed, as is typical in such cases, tried repeatedly to get the bereaved widowed mother to accept 'informal' restitution in the form of money. I have been unable to find out if she ultimately was browbeaten into accepting or not. I have provided an account from TTMOP in the annexes on the victim, 12 year old

Shazia Bashir. This also demonstrates how entrenched Islamic extremism is in the top echelons of parts of Pakistan's legal system, which therefore has implications for the realistic prospect of justice for Christians in Pakistan.

....

Annex Regarding Sexual harassment and assault of Christian women from TTMOP p394-6

5.10 - Marriage, Sex, Slavery and Employment

Page | 35

There have been a number of mentions of rape earlier in this report, and this is not a case of using a few extreme examples. The rate of rape of minority women is not easily quantifiable, but it is known to be colossally high. Some estimates from activists and priests on the ground I've seen put the rate of cases of kidnap, rape, forced conversion to Islam and marriage as high as over two a day for Christians, and about the same for Hindus, counting over 1800 such cases in 2011, and it is on the rise. (mxix) Please note that this is only for cases of kidnap and forced conversion. The actual rape rate has to be, from very strong anecdotal evidence, massively higher. We have already covered the health sector earlier in the report, a sector where staff have given figures for Christian nurses raped on the job as being in the 100's per year. Nor does the 'two a day' estimate include those cases where women are simply raped and murdered, or the cases where the women are killed for resisting kidnap and rape. All these types of rape case involve an age range from (rarely, it seems) 50's, down to girls aged 9 or 10 or younger, with the range 12 to mid 20's seeming to be a particularly common targeted set. As well as nurses, domestic staff are particularly vulnerable to 'seduction' or sexual assault by their employers, especially as many of them are very young girls or teenagers forced to work to help their families survive. The possible incredibly endemic nature of the problem can be seen from an incident in a small village about 20km south east of the Punjab city of Multan, where the utterly impoverished Christians worked for the Muslim farmers – the men in the fields and the women as domestic servants. The women were continually sexually assaulted and raped by the men in the families they worked for, who told them that if they refused to have sex, all the Christians would be expelled from the village. It got so bad that the women eventually complained so much that four Christian men protested to the Muslims about the treatment of their women, and in retaliation the Muslim villagers then expelled the whole Christian community, as they had promised. The Christians didn't go to the police, because they knew that if they did, they would have false blasphemy charges laid against them. (mxx) Whether the situation is as extreme in other villages as this one is unknown, but it cannot be unique. Not only this, but many cases of 'simple' kidnap and rape are done by men (often the sons) from wealthy and powerful families, often the employers of the victim's fathers and relatives. With some cases, it is actually the police who are the perpetrators. In other cases the attackers are religious students and extremists who deliberately target Christian women and girls. In at least one case they were told at Islamicist conventions that if they marry or even just rape a non-Muslim girl, they will receive 70 virgins in heaven, the same as martyrs are supposed to. (mxxi) Thus one rapist told his young victim 'Don't worry, I've provided this service to many other little Christian girls'. (mxxii)

This power differential is one reason why rape cases are so under-reported, massively more under-reported even than in Western nations. Those who manage to escape forced conversions and marriage (although in the eyes of Pakistani law and most Muslims, they can never escape their conversion) consistently report that if they ever had to go before Pakistani courts enquiring into whether they had married and converted of their own free will, they were threatened with death, or the death of their families, or with laying blasphemy charges against their family, to get them to claim they did it all of their own free will. This was often with physical and mental torture, along with the rapes. In addition, those who end up being 'married' for a long time and then escaping frequently report continued abuse from their new 'families'.

Even if the woman or girl in question is simply kidnapped and raped before being let go, their trauma at the hands of their attackers may not end. In some cases, the attackers are known to them and have been harassing them for sex, or marriage, or to convert to Islam, or all three. In a deeply honour-shame oriented culture like Pakistan, the attackers now have an extra potent weapon to use

against their victims alongside weapons like the threat of blasphemy accusations. They are then in a position to blackmail the victim into sexual 'favours', marriage or conversion by threatening to tell the victim's family, or to let the whole world know. This is because as well as bringing shame on the family, victims of rape are deemed to be no longer marry-able. In many cases, the attackers will video the rape on mobile phones and post it onto social sites or go and show it to the family, demanding the family give the victims hand in marriage, or else face the consequences. Some do defy the shame to try and press charges, but naturally, we have no idea about those who don't, those who fold, keep quiet, or otherwise acquiesce. Given that society in general wants people to convert to Islam, and if you marry a Muslim man you are ipso-facto assumed to have converted, it is not surprising that society, police and the courts frequently side with the attacker, even without taking the power differential into account. In nearly all reported cases, the family of the attacker and other Muslims continuously threaten the victim's family to withdraw the charges and / or urge the invariably poverty-stricken family to accept 'compensation' – and police often urge this too. Police also often dismiss relatives of kidnapped girls, even beating them, and saying 'They have become Muslims now, forget them'. (mxxiii)

Furthermore, due to Pakistan's Sharia based laws, someone who is a victim of rape is often imprisoned for sexual immorality and released from prison only on condition that she marry her rapist (and as we have seen the laws already weigh especially heavily against minority women – and in addition, to prove a rape charge requires four independent male witnesses). (mxxiv)

Many apparent cases of kidnap, rape and forced marriage and conversion are in fact cases of kidnap into the sex slave trade and Pakistan's illegal but prevalent prostitution industry. There are estimated to be 20,000 minors involved in prostitution in Pakistan. Some men also 'hire' prostitutes as second wives and give them ongoing financial support. In at least one case, a wealthy Muslim seizing a Christian girl has openly told the distraught father that he was going to 'purify' her by making her a Muslim and then keep her as his mistress. In addition, Muslim practice allows a form of sanctioned prostitution called 'temporary wives' that also influences attitudes. On top of straightforward prostitution, there is also a thriving market in buying wives. A prominent political and religious leader from the Sindh province, Mian Mithoo, repeatedly crops up in reports indicating that he engages in kidnapping minority girls and giving them to his family members or political and religious followers as material bribes, or selling them on to wealthy landowners as wives. Other people in the sex-slave trade are criminals with powerful political links too. (mxxv)

One local priest in the aftermath of a sexual attack summed up the attitude behind such attacks as follows:

Christian girls are considered goods to be damaged at leisure. Abusing them is a right. According to the community's mentality it is not even a crime. Muslims regard them as spoils of war.

Aside from the more serious assaults, Christian women and girls routinely experience sexual harassment, often having to run a gauntlet of abuse while going into and out of church services and prayer meetings. (mxxvi)

Footnotes

mxix

Unstated (2012) 'Christian girls in Pakistan continue to be kidnapped, abducted and forcibly converted to Islam' <http://www.pakistanchristianpost.com/headlinenewsd.php?hnewsid=3659> Pakistan Christian Post 30 July 2012. Accessed 02 February 2013.

Mirza, A (2012) '2,000 minorities girls converted to Islam forcibly: report'

[http://www.dailytimes.com.pk/default.asp?page=2012%](http://www.dailytimes.com.pk/default.asp?page=2012%2005%20September%202012) Daily Times 05 September 2012. Accessed 02 February 2013

mxx

Unstated (2010) 'Muslims Order Christians to Leave Village'
<http://www.worldwatchmonitor.org/english/country/pakistan/21375> World Watch Monitor /
 Compass Direct News 7 June 2010. Accessed 02 February 2013

Page | 37

mxxi

Unstated (2010) 'Muslims in Pakistan Kidnap, Rape Christian Girl'
<http://www.worldwatchmonitor.org/english/country/pakistan/21649> World Watch Monitor /
 Compass Direct News 16 June 2010. Accessed 02 February 2013

mxxii

Unstated (2010) 'Muslim Villager in Pakistan Allegedly Rapes Sixth Christian Girl'
<http://www.worldwatchmonitor.org/english/country/pakistan/31261> World Watch Monitor /
 Compass Direct News 14 January 2011. Accessed 02 February 2013

mxxiii

For examples of all these kinds of situation just search for 'rape' in the Chronological section.

mxxiv

Shea, N (2011) 'Another Christian Martyred in Pakistan'
<http://www.nationalreview.com/corner/284856/another-christian-martyred-pakistan-nina-shea>
 National Review 4 December 2011. Accessed 02 February 2013. An example of a murder during an
 attempted kidnap, but especially read the fourth paragraph.

mxxv

http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Prostitution_in_Pakistan Accessed 02 February 2013
 'Zeeba' (2012) 'Mian Mithu is innocent and is in dire need of further State cover'
<http://criticalppp.com/archives/76022> Let us Build Pakistan 18 April 2012. Accessed 02 February
 2013. This rather sarcastic article deals with kidnap of Hindu girls.
 Spencer, R (2012) 'Pakistan: Higher Court orders kidnapped Christian woman to stay with her
 Muslim kidnapper husband' [http://www.jihadwatch.org/2012/10/pakistan-higher-court-orders-
 kidnapped-christian-woman-to-stay-with-her-muslim-kidnapper-husband.html](http://www.jihadwatch.org/2012/10/pakistan-higher-court-orders-kidnapped-christian-woman-to-stay-with-her-muslim-kidnapper-husband.html) Jihad Watch 26
 October 2012. Accessed 02 February 2013. This case is the same perpetrator, but a Christian victim.
 For other cases, search the Chronological section using 'kidnap' and you will soon find further cases.
 A probable further contributing factor to the high rate rape is the massive use of online pornography
 in Pakistan, as evidence, among other things, by the high rate of sex search terms used in Google
 from Pakistan. http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Pornography_in_Pakistan Accessed 02 February 2013
 'Web Desk' (2011) 'Pakistan maintains top slot in Google search for 'sex''
<http://tribune.com.pk/story/313169/pakistan-maintains-top-slot-in-google-search-for-sex/> The
 Express Tribune 28 December 2011. Accessed 02 February 2013
 Morgan, K (2010) 'No. 1 Nation in Sexy Web Searches? Call it Pornistan'
<http://www.foxnews.com/world/2010/07/12/data-shows-pakistan-googling-pornographic-material/>
 Fox News 13 July 2010. Accessed 02 February 2013
 Unstated (2012) 'Christians Girls being raped and tortured in Essa Nagri Karachi'
[http://globalchristianvoice.wordpress.com/2012/03/27/christians-girls-being-raped-and-tortured-in-
 essa-nagri-karachi-the-news/](http://globalchristianvoice.wordpress.com/2012/03/27/christians-girls-being-raped-and-tortured-in-essa-nagri-karachi-the-news/) Global Christian Voice 27 March 2012. Accessed 02 February 2013

mxxvi

Unstated (2010) 'ASIA/PAKISTAN - Catholic girl raped by a Muslim'

<http://www.fides.org/aree/news/newsdet.php?idnews=28031&lan=eng> Agenzia Fides 18
December 2012. Accessed 02 February 2013

Unstated (2003) 'Prayer Meeting Attacked' <http://www.persecution.net/pk-2003-05-21.htm> The
Voice of the Martyrs 21 May 2003. Accessed 02 February 2013. This is just one example of sexual
harassment at prayer meetings.

Annex on Religion and Blasphemy from TTMOP p283

[A]t least 50 % of blasphemy charges since the amendments have been against religious minorities (Ahmadis, Sikhs, Hindus, Christians, etc). Some figures say it is as much as 57%. If we take the usually quoted figures that minorities constitute about 5% of the population, then this means that minorities are 10 times as likely to be targeted by an accusation of blasphemy as the Muslim majority population. Even if we accept the claims that Christians have been massively under-represented in the official statistics, and take the higher figures given by some Christian activists, and assume that minorities may be up to as much as 20% of the population, this still means that minorities are close to three times more likely to be targeted.

Page | 39

For the record, according to Pakistan's National Commission for Justice and Peace (a Catholic NGO), the breakdown over the last quarter of a century is 1058 cases, with 449 of those being against Muslims. 456 were against Ahmadis (unsurprising given that 2 of the laws apply only to them), 132 against Christians, and 21 against Hindus. Even if the higher population estimates for Christians are correct (for arguments sake, let's say 15%), then Christians and Hindus are targeted about equally. If the more normal lower figures are correct, then Christians join Ahmadis in being targeted in a massively disproportionate manner.

This shows that regardless of what else we say of the blasphemy laws, they are undoubtedly used as a weapon of oppression that affects non-Muslims (or Muslim sects deemed outside the pale) disproportionately – massively so.

Annex on Kanewal and Shanti-Nagar attack – January and February 1997, psychological effects ongoing, police incitement

Page | 40

Shanti Nagar is a predominantly Salvation Army village in the Punjab province, founded in 1916, of around 25-30,000 people. Apart from about 15 Muslim families – for whom the other villagers built a mosque - the inhabitants are Christian. Hard work in farming meant the village was relatively prosperous. On 17th January police raided the house of a 60 year old Christian, claiming intelligence of alcohol-drinking and gambling going on. The police regularly raided the village on such pretexts – usually about every fortnight, probably because of jealousy over the Christian village’s prosperity. They would harass the villagers, and because the villagers were rich enough to bribe the corrupt police, they always came back for more. Anyway, despite - as ever – no gambling or alcohol or anything else illegal going on there, the constables searched his property, and amidst the ransacking a box with a bible fell out. The police deliberately kicked and desecrated the bible, and took the man to the police station, even though they had found nothing illegal, and were trying to get a large bribe from him. The residents of the village protested the raid, the false arrest and the desecration of the bible, and also the numerous false blasphemy accusations that had been made against villagers. They asked for charges under article 295 to be brought against the policeman responsible. Even after police investigations found the charge to be true, the police refused to act until sustained pressure resulted in a promise to suspend the officers responsible and take them to court. Then the police pressured the village for the matter to be settled out of court, but they refused and the senior police officer threatened to act in way that meant they would not be able to stand on their own feet for at least 50 years. On 3rd February, a general election day, he posted the policeman who had kicked the bible to Shanti Nagar as security officer. This made the villagers even more angry as it proved the promises by higher police officers to take action was a lie, and they protested even more, so the police hatched a plot. Two days later, a Muslim man went to an abandoned mosque 2km from Shanti Nagar and found – so he said – torn pages of the Quran with blasphemous words and the name and address of the Christian from Shanti-Nagar who complained about his bible being desecrated, along with several others. He took it to the police station of the nearby city of Khanewal, a stronghold of an Islamicist group with ties to Bin Laden called Harkat-ul-Insar. Within 30 minutes of registering a case (and several Christians being arrested), mosque loud speakers from the city and all the Muslim villages around about were calling all faithful Muslims to wage jihad against Shanti Nagar, using word for word identical language. City church priests rushed to warn senior officials of the impending attack, and were promised that all appropriate measures would be made, but that too was a lie. Late that night, mobs started attacking churches, Christian homes and shops and medical dispensaries in Khanewal, setting them and their contents on fire. The next morning, the mob attacked the Catholic church just outside the city Council buildings. Bibles and other books were gathered from churches and burned, and the Holy Communion bread thrown on the floor, statues and the like were systematically smashed. 100’s attacked the priests house and burned all the parish records. Pleas for police help went unheeded, they just stood by and watched. The mob attacked a Christian boys school. Many fled, but about 50 of the youngest hid under their beds. The mob set fire to mattresses over them, and they had to flee for their lives, several being carried out unconscious. They burned all the school records and furniture. They then attacked the Salvation army church and pharmacy, and re-attacked the Church of Pakistan building they had attacked the night before. Christians in local shops and homes fled for their lives, but those who were caught

were severely beaten. Again the police did nothing. The mob only retreated when Christians started throwing bricks and stones to defend their homes.

At the same time, Muslims on motorbikes went from one Muslim community to another, asking them to assemble close to Shanti Nagar, and they started to do so. One of the original complainants from Shanti-Nagar and his family were stopped in their car and he was beaten badly. The police officer who threatened the village arrived with a magistrate, warned that a mob was coming, that the residents should hand in all their guns, and stay inside, and that the mob would just shout slogans and then leave. This was all a lie. Those few who kept their weapons were the only ones whose houses survived untouched.

The mob went to a nearby factory and forced the workers to strike and join them, and then launched an all out assault, led by some estimated 400 police in plain clothes who handed out grenades to the militants, and Muslim clerics. On the way to the village they blew up Salvation army hospitals and buildings, and many homes. When they reached the village, the mob, bearing placards saying 'Kill the Christians, blasphemers against the Koran and the Prophet', cut both the phone lines and the electricity. The mob was at least 30,000 strong, armed with homemade bombs, pistols, grenades, some kind of incendiary powder, metal rods, knives and the like. Then they attacked in three waves. The first rushed in and grabbed all the money and jewellery, fridges, TV's and other valuables from each house. The second drove away and stole all the village's livestock. The third were terrorists, aided by police, who put down incendiary powder in each house and ignited them by firing shots from their guns. Whatever was used, it burned so fiercely that iron rods in the houses melted. All the personal legal documents were burned, the mango orchards were destroyed. It was quite evident that the offence was Christians prospering, and the goal was to totally break the village's back economically. They also forced the villagers at gun and knifepoint to recite verses from the Quran, and those who refused to say the Islamic creed (ie convert to Islam) were beaten badly. Meanwhile, the army was called in, and given control, against the wishes of the police, who deliberately gave faulty directions and obstructed the army as they could, saying the smoke was from tyres set on fire by the demonstrators, and that everything was under control. When the army finally arrived, the mob fled, but only after taking all water taps and destroying all means of getting water to fight the fires. The army was able to arrest a few looters, but the police then let them go. The Churches were left totally destroyed, most homes had only walls left. The Christians had no bedding, no utensils to cook and eat with, no spare clothes. All that had not been taken, had been burnt. Several married women were 'persuaded' to leave their husbands and marry Muslim men right there and then, and only the arrival of the army stopped this happening to more women. The mob also attacked and destroyed churches and homes in several surrounding villages. In at least one village the women were forced to work in the fields for the mob.

Estimates of the extent of the destruction vary – depending in part which townships and villages you include in the statistics, but it seems like over 2000 homes were destroyed, 13 churches, several schools and medical facilities, many shops, tractors and other farming equipment, in what was systematic economic and religious warfare. It happened at a time of local political strife and increasing economic difficulty, and it appears that jealousy of the relative prosperity of Christian communities was a large part of the motivation.

Estimated losses to the Christian communities were about (minimum) £632 million. The local government gave a very small amount of compensation to only some 200 families affected. Despite repeated appeals, the Federal government, after rebuilding the houses destroyed, after international pressure, has given precisely zero compensation to date.

Page | 42

In addition, when Christians in Karachi peacefully protested outside the state governor's house there, they were tear-gassed and shot by police. 100's were knocked unconscious by the gas, dozens were injured, and nine were shot, and one of those died of his injuries, handcuffed to the hospital bed, as he was also one of over 1,000 Christians arrested.

Local Muslim shopkeepers refused to sell food to Christians in the immediate aftermath of the attack. There were no deaths, thankfully, but the psychological damage has been extensive and long-lasting. Christian children who played with their Muslim neighbours, who attended each other's family weddings and funerals, saw those same playmates and neighbours loot and burn down their houses, and now have a great fear of meeting with Muslims. In at least one case, Muslim school children at a Salvation Army school burnt down their own school. To forgive was a struggle, and for a number of years, the Christians decided to give the Muslims a taste of the medicine given out to minority Christians elsewhere, by giving Muslims their own separate utensils for eating and drinking (a practice common in Pakistan, where Christians are 'unclean' and anything they touch unsuitable for Muslims). Young children developed schizophrenia, or have been afraid to go outside their houses ever since. Some old people died soon after from shock. All of the villagers tremble and cry when remembering the attack, and all admit they now distrust Muslims in general, and that 15 years later, if they have to travel to Muslim villages, they are paranoid and afraid.

(Sources in footnotes:

<http://www.pakistanchristianpost.com/viewarticles.php?editorialid=64>

http://www.bitsonline.net/eqbal/articles_by_eqbal_view_69F6E888.htm

<http://www.asianews.it/news-en/Christians-of-Shanti-Nagar-remember-the-massacre-of-1997-17569.html>

<http://www.pbs.org/wnet/need-to-know/security/pakistan-blasphemy-laws-retake-center-stage/7546/>

http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Harkat_ul-Ansar)

Annex on 'Wrong Way' Mixed Marriages in Pakistan

Page | 43

In the recent country guidance for Christians in Pakistan, AK and SK (Christians:risk) Pakistan GC, paragraph 218, the judge referred to an elopement between a Christian male and Muslim female in 2010, and stated that the elopement was the primary cause of the trouble and that there was no report of an ensuing marriage. However, more information including the anti-Christian threats and actions taken out in that case can be found in the 2010 South Asian Human Rights report on Pakistan, which itself took details from the 2010 Annual Report of the Human Rights Commission of Pakistan. <http://www.southasianrights.org/wp-content/uploads/2011/06/Status-of-Minorities-Pakistan-2010.pdf>.

'In June, a Muslim landlord in Okara detained 43 members of a Christian family after a Christian boy reportedly eloped with the landlord's daughter. The landlord threatened to kill all the detained Christians unless the girl was returned to the family.'

Testimony about a 2011 case taken from a June 2011 appeal and petition to Dutch Parliament by the Central Committee of the Dutch-Pakistani Christian community. This document also contains testimony about illegal police raids of Christian NGO's and the way government 'development' of minority areas is subverted and a deception, as well as deprivation of facilities in the Christian 'safe' area of Youhanabad.

<http://www.pakistanchristianpost.com/headlinenewsd.php?hnewsid=2879>

Along with this, there is need to address religious extremism and inefficacy of state institutions in providing safety to religious minorities and non-government institution that work for minorities. On June 1, 2011 the office of Community Development Initiative (CDI), an affiliate of European Centre for Law and Justice, was illegally raided by dozens of policemen for providing free legal assistance to the Christian families of Sheikhpura. The matter arose after a Muslim girl, Saliha Noreen, eloped with the Christian boy named Sajid Ashraf on May 13, 2011. Since then the Christian families were routinely harassed, assaulted, tortured and taken into illegal custody by the Muslim girl's Gujjar caste members. On June 1, 2011 the Gujjars beat Christians in the Sessions Court of Sheikhpura in the court premises the presence of three police vehicles. In this all illegality, the local police of Saddar Police Station, Sheikhpura remained a close aide to the Gujjars. The Muslims also held Sajid Ashraf's two unmarried sisters Rakhil Ashraf (25) and Mariam Ashraf (23) hostage for several days. So frightened that the girls could not dare to speak up their ordeal they had gone through. Several Christian leaders informed the District Police Officer of Sheikhpura about the ongoing tribulation the Christians of Sheikhpura going through but the police did not take any step to protect these poor Christians.(reference) When the CDI began providing legal assistance to these Christians, the Saddar Police Station reached in Lahore on June 1, 2011, broke the doors of the office and trespassed the building. The police also raided the house of CDI Field Officer Napoleon Qayyum and harassed his family.

In most of the cases, as we have seen Sajid Ashraf's case, the police prove a brutal force against the Christian community and it clearly sides with the Muslims. For example, on (date) City Police Station registered a blasphemy case against Saleem Masih in Chichawatani. (reference) The first information report, (numbered) clearly states that Masih was "addressing the stars" while using foul language against the sage of Islam. It clearly shows that even the complainant of the case was sure that Masih

was mentally ill. Masih's family provided prescription and medicine to the police to prove that he was mentally ill, but the police still filed a case against him and now Masih is in jail. Due to the communal tensions in the area, even a bail application has not yet been moved in the court because of the local Muslim clerics have warned the family of serious repercussions if they helped mentally ill Masih. This all is going on under the nose of the local police. Who can then stand for justice when the local police are part of problem rather than part of the solution?

Lastly, the development process should be based on the principles of equity and justice. Again, there is systematic discrimination towards minorities in this process. Minority areas are deliberately ignored in development schemes. Hindu areas in the province of Sindh and Christian areas in the Punjab are comparatively underdeveloped. Often development schemes announced for the minority areas are not implemented and the funds are later diverted to the areas of Muslims. Christians have long been pointing out this injustice. On June 6, 2011 it was also pointed out in a very famous TV talk show, named Khari Baat with Lukhman, on Duniya TV news channel that a Christian colony, Yahounabad in Lahore, had a population around 100,000 but there not a single public school or health facility in this area.

Pakistani Newspaper article 29 September 2012 about one such case and the aftermath where the Christian husband converted to Islam to try, unsuccessfully, to avoid repercussions on the Christian community and his own family.

<http://tribune.com.pk/story/444262/honour-at-stake-love-in-the-time-of-blasphemy/>

In a village in Narowal district, a Muslim girl and a Christian boy decided to elope.

Now, in the aftermath, 30 Christian families are on the run.

Sana, 23, and Chand Masih, 25, eloped from their houses in Gadawal village on September 21, and went to an undisclosed location. The girl's family searched for her for two days before a local cleric decided to intervene, and turn the heat on the entire Christian community.

Local clerics, under the leadership of Maulana Amjad Farooqi, reached the girl's residence and convinced her father to take a firm stand against the Christians who, Farooqi claimed, had "pre-planned" the event.

Following that, a large number of people gathered in the village, called out the Christians of the locality, and warned them to bring back the eloped couple or else their houses would be burnt down.

Christians flee

The Christians fled the village and the locals locked their houses behind them. The area's Muslim population also took the cattle of the family of Chand Masih into their custody.

After two days, they traced a few members of the fleeing Christian community and asked them to bring back the eloped couple. When the families expressed their inability to trace the couple due to lack of finances, the Muslims sold a cow of the accused boy's family for Rs30,000, and gave the family Rs10,000 to trace the couple.

Teaching them a lesson

Maulana Farooqi confirmed that a cow had been sold to trace the couple, while speaking to The Express Tribune.

Page | 45

He said he openly warned the Christians that they have already “hurt their [Muslims’] sentiments by releasing the blasphemous movie [The Innocence of Muslims] and now with this step, they have added fuel to the fire.”

Farooqi said in case they do not bring back the girl, “it would take 10 minutes to teach a lesson to the Christians” of the locality.

He said they had arrested one man, who was purportedly in contact with the accused, but the police released him. He added that the girl’s father is bound not to take any step without the clerics’ consent.

Fear spreads

The incident took place in Gadawal village, where only 15 Christian families are residing, but some families of adjoining villages have also fled after the threats, said Irfan Gill, a member of the Christian community, while speaking to The Express Tribune.

He said the Christians of the locality went to the influential Muslims in the area once, and apologised in return for their safety, but the Muslims were firm that they want the accused boy.

Boy converts to Islam

The accused boy, Chand Masih, has sent a court order and certificate of his conversion to Islam to the police station, said Raiyya police chief Amanat Ali.

The court order says the girl married of her own choosing, and no one had kidnapped or compelled her to do so, he added.

Ali said the girl’s family was initially not keen on registering an FIR, but one was lodged nonetheless against three Christians. The girl administered intoxicants to her family through food at night and eloped with the boy, he added.

Community blamed for individuals

Human Liberation Commission of Pakistan chief Aslam Parvez Sahotra condemned the incident and termed it “a tool for victimisation of Christians”.

The Christian community held protests alongside Muslim against the sacrilegious film but is still held responsible for the act of a single individual, he said.

Law-enforcement agencies must protect the minorities from communal punishments, he added.

September 2014 example:

<http://www.britishpakistanichristians.co.uk/blog/christian-boys-marriage-to-a-muslim-girl-causes-torture-of-family-and-his-arrest-despite-conversion->

A Christian boy Akram Masih and his family, including several females, were severely beaten and tortured by Policemen and other extremists in Multan, on 16th October 2014. The policemen entered his home by climbing over the perimeter walls in order to arrest Akram, because he was in marriage with a Muslim girl, Maria Bibi (originally from District Shiekhupura).

Page | 46

Advocate Sardar Mushtaq Gill, Human Rights Defender and Chief of LEAD was informed by Moderator Bishop Asher Kamran, of Methodist Church of Pakistan, Multan who requested for legal assistance for Akram's release.

Bishop Kamran said;

"We have already had written a request application submitted to the Inspector General of Punjab, Lahore, calling for him to dismiss the false FIR No.1093/2014 (17.10.14), registered at Police Station Factory Area."

The police have also arrested one Christian relative of the boy from Lahore.

Akram Masih from Multan and the Muslim girl from Sheikhpura fell in love with each other over the phone. The girl left her home willingly on 16th September 2014 and went to see her lover in Multan, where they both got married according to Islamic Sharia law. Akram Masih even went as far as converting to Islam, due to his love for the girl and to save himself and his family from police and extremists. However, the conversion proved worthless when Police forcibly broke into his home and arrested him using excessive violence.

All the accused have been incarcerated at Police Station Factory Area, Sheikhpura.

.....

Mr. Gill along with Aric John contacted local Police and have submitted documents proving the legal marriage of the couple and conversion of the Christian man from Christianity to Islam. The SHO responded by explaining that Akram Masih would appear in the court before Mr. Matieon Rehman, Judicial Magistrate, Tehsil Courts Ferozwala District, Sheikhpura. They are also recording a statement from the girl under section 164C of the Pakistan Penal Code. They explained that if the girl provided a testimony in favour of Akram and the marriage, then he would be released.

On the 17th October 2014 both Christians appeared in court in which a large Muslim mob were creating great tension. Only two days earlier in a similar case one man was shot dead inside the court premises during the hearing.

The couple were given a chance to speak before a magistrate and to talk to each other in relative privacy, by ordering both the prosecution and defence lawyers to vacate the court room. However Akram was betrayed by his lover who recorded her statement against him with tears in her eyes.. Both Christian men have been sentenced for kidnap. Since the sentencing Akram Masih has disclosed to Mr. Gill that the girl was threatened by her family, who told her that if she gave a statement in his favour, they would kill both of them. Akram believes that his lover has saved his life by recording the statement against him.

It is forbidden in Islamic Sharia for a Muslim woman to get married with a Christian man or man from any other religion but Islam. However it is permitted for a Muslim woman to get married with a

Christian convert to Islam. In Pakistan, the level of religious extremism means that it is culturally intolerable for the marriage between a Christian man and Muslim woman, even if the Christian converts to Islam.

Annex on Shazia Bashir's murder by Top Pakistani Lawyer

From TTMOP p368-9

Page | 48

A twelve year old Christian girl, Shazia Bashir, from an impoverished family starts work as a maid in the house of a High Court lawyer, Chaudhary Muhammad Naeem, in Lahore, in about May 2009. Her widowed mother married a seventy year old blind man and had to send her to work (for about \$12 a month) as it was the only way of getting money for the family. She did this after a man came repeatedly, saying that he had connections who would offer good, well paid work, with great conditions and education, plus money towards the girl's dowry. He got her to talk to alleged referees from other cases he had handled. Eventually the mother agreed, but really he was a slave trafficker who targeted illiterate minority families. The young girl went off to work for Naeem. Naeem and his family forced her to stay full time at the house, work exceedingly long hours, including washing cars with cold water in the winter with very little clothing and massaging family members, and refused all requests by her family to see her. He never paid her any money, and if she ever asked for it, she was insulted. In about October 2009, Naeem allowed her family to talk to her for five minutes, and she said that both Naeem and his son were raping her, and that the rest of the family were beating her and threatening to harm her if she escaped. Naeem was enraged, and when the family tried to take her home, grabbed her by the hair and dragged her into the house, then came out and threatened dire consequences if they filed a case against him for slave labour. The family went to a police station, where the officers lied to them, claiming that a case couldn't be registered against a lawyer. Neighbours report that the family tortured the girl; they could hear her crying for mercy in the night. They say she was beaten if she ever asked for food, and was even beaten for picking a piece of raw sugar cane off the lawn to eat – but they never said or did anything at the time. She was starved, and in January 2010 when her condition was bad, Naeem finally let her family have her. They took her to hospital, but she died several days later. An autopsy showed she had been drugged, totally malnourished and had numerous wounds on her body – thirteen from a blunt instrument and five from a sharp weapon.

Naeem offered the family about \$250 to pay for her funeral and keep quiet, but they refused, so he went away hurling death threats at the family. He also went to the parent's house along with an army general and offered \$1600 to the same end. As well, he is reported to have threatened legal action against the father and media who got hold of the story, even sending messages later from prison, saying 'I am a lawyer and will see that you cannot pursue this case because the court and the lawyer community is with me' and 'if you shout nobody will listen and they will never get anything'. Police were initially reluctant to register a case, and it was only when the family and other Christians protested for several hours outside the state assembly the next day that a case was registered against Naeem, family members and others. Naeem and his family then fled, but were arrested soon after. Naeem initially claimed to the police she had fallen down the stairs. Then he said she had been beaten for stealing food from the fridge, finally saying she was insane, disobedient and stubborn, and so she 'got thrashed and died'. At the initial court hearing, Naeem was left unguarded, even though it was a capital case. Muslim lawyers stormed the court in support of Naeem, chanted against Christians and the media, prevented journalists from entering the court, plus they also smashed up police cars outside, forcing the judge to postpone the hearing. Lawyers also went on strike and the Lahore Bar association, of whom Naeem had been president, said that any attorney who represented the girl would have their membership revoked. Naeem's lawyers chanted slogans

against Shazia's family, threatened and beat them, including the 70 year old blind step-father, and drove them from the courthouse, this despite government ministers and prominent politicians promising justice for them. In addition, there were all sorts of shenanigans over her death certificate. The hospital told the family she had been raped and murdered and said they would get the death certificate to that effect in a few days. However, a nine doctor medical board –something unprecedented in all of Pakistan's history –was convened. All the doctors were Muslim, and the next day they declared she wasn't raped or tortured, but died of a skin infection, and on this basis Naeem was later released for 'lack of evidence', ignoring the testimony of her family and the hospital reports.

Page | 49

(Sources from footnotes:

<http://www.worldwatchmonitor.org/english/country/pakistan/14532>

<http://www.asianews.it/news-en/Lahore:-12-year-old-Christian-domestic-worker-killed-by-Muslim-employer-17437.html>

http://www.youtube.com/watch?feature=player_embedded&v=gxRhIOyaYcl#!

<http://www.fides.org/aree/news/newsdet.php?idnews=27881&lan=eng>

Annex on Christians burned alive in Pakistan in the last year.

November 2014. Young Christian couple in remote village burned to death for alleged blasphemy in front of at least some of their children.

Page | 50

The couple had moved to be brick kiln workers and were indebted to their employer / landlord. The wife's father died a few days before, and she was clearing out his things, including burning occult materials he had. The wife was pregnant, and they already had five children. The wife had reportedly also been raped by the accountant/ manager of the brick kiln. The wife was accused of blasphemy over the material she burned, the couple were seized and held, and told they would only be released if they paid in full with interest the loan – when the very same manager had been deliberately underpaying them so they could not pay it off. However, a mob was formed, and they stormed the location where they had been kidnapped, seized them, stripped them naked, dragged them through the village behind a tractor to the brick kiln whilst beating them severely, breaking all their limbs and threw them, possibly still alive, into the brick kiln. Their eldest child witnessed the attack on his parents. Some reports indicated that the wife didn't burn well so she was pulled out, doused in petrol and thrown back in the brick kiln. Police on the scene did nothing, refusing to even fire guns into the air to try and disperse the mob, despite pleas from onlookers. They later said there was not enough police present, and also interfered in the surviving families rights as part of a likely cover-up attempt, although 44 people were arrested.

<http://www.britishpakistanichristians.co.uk/blog/christian-couple-burnt-alive-in-brick-kiln-after-alleged-blasphemy>

<http://www.britishpakistanichristians.co.uk/blog/police-stood-back-and-watched-while>

<http://www.britishpakistanichristians.co.uk/blog/eldest-son-of-shahzad-and-shama-witnessed-the-attack>

This was in a rural area. I repeatedly hear from decision makers about how things are so much better in the cities, but whilst that may be relatively true, it is not nearly as good as they say, and the other example of a Christian being burnt alive was in a city, Lahore in the aftermath of the double church suicide bombing there, and there was no blasphemy allegations involved. The already orphaned teenage boy was killed just for being a Christian. He was locking up the shop he worked at for the time of Friday Muslim prayers, when two men came up to him, asking if he was a Christian. When he said he was, they beat him and chased him before dousing him in petrol and setting fire to him. He was taken to hospital with 55% burns, but died a few days later from his injuries. The local community reports increasing fear, and threats, and it seems pressure was applied to the victim and his family before he passed away as to the identity of his attackers. Some parts of Pakistani media spread lies that he was really killed by his own family.

<http://www.britishpakistanichristians.co.uk/blog/hatred-towards-christians-in-lahore-results-in-teenager-being-severely-burned>

<http://www.britishpakistanichristians.co.uk/blog/nouman-masih-rip>

<http://www.britishpakistanichristians.co.uk/blog/family-of-nouman-masih-rip-speak-of-the-great-solace-they-have-knowing-he-is-in-heaven-in-a-place-wi>

Annex on Christians experience of Mainstream University

One of BPCA's officers tells of her experiences at a mainstream university in Pakistan:

Page | 51 <http://www.britishpakistanichristians.co.uk/blog/pakistani-christian-young-woman-describes-her-trials-at-university>

'Being a Pakistani girl and being Christian Pakistani girl is not an easy deal - trust me!

Why is there such a price to pay, simply for a choice of belief? I find it derisory that a state counts the protection of humanity for little or nothing, a state which is so frightened by Christians – a tiny minority who may seem funny or odd but who never pose any threat or give any genuine offence to anyone.

My excitement of enrolling as a university student ended with the reality of life on campus: constant questions and the slow realisation that I count for nothing in my own society. I sometimes wonder why I ever came. It baffles me how a society can be so brutal as to impose such harshness on someone who does not want to fight. I believe no one can call themselves educated who does not respect that which belongs to others. Yet, I cannot express even these sentiments without fear of reprisal.

Facing open criticism from university lecturers and daily taunts from every level was not easy. Carefully constructed, trick questions, at first, forced me to question my very identity. I remained quiet and prayed that silence and peace would surround me.

On my first day as an undergraduate, it was somewhat akin to entering a war zone alone and unarmed. I had to be seen to agree with everything everyone said. I considered adopting a policy of isolation, avoiding friendships and simply attending classes to learn. Things were tough day by day and there were certain people who with the beginning of a frank discussion finally asking me with "Why don't you want to be a right person? Why don't you want to go to heaven?" Well, I felt like telling them, if heaven is to be got at this cost then I would simply prefer hell.

In reality, I had no words to respond to them or tell them the truth because, in their eyes, it's the greatest sin that I exist as a Christian at all so even a word from me at all would count as blasphemy. I realised then and there why so many young people hide their identity, terrified of the blasphemy law. Yet, paradoxically, every year, many Pakistanis leave for tertiary education in foreign countries without any fear of discrimination or harassment. So, then, why should any Pakistani girl – but particularly a Christian one - suffer to be educated here in Pakistan?

Recently, one of my close friends formed a group with others and came to me asking me to read the Quran and be a Muslim so that they could "trust me to be their friend". In the light of the blasphemy law, it is hard to know how to respond.

During all such incidents, I continually pray and ask for God's mercy on them because they know not what they are doing. I thank God for His grace! I encourage my Christian brothers and sisters to be wise and not to be afraid. Death is coming for us all one day so let them know who we are following by letting your identity reflect His grace and therefore, being a light to others.'

The other article from a few years ago is by a Christian from one of the relatively 'elite' Christian families, and yet her experiences show a completely different outlook to that one that decision makers repeatedly say holds true for relatively well-off Christians amidst the supposedly more amenable and tolerant and liberal elite.

Page | 52 <http://blogs.tribune.com.pk/story/10909/a-disappointed-pakistani-christian/>

'Dear Pakistani Muslims,

Pakistan has been hell for my family and I.

Yes, we get Christmas and have a few churches here and there and attend the same schools as the rest of you, but life as Christian minorities has been torture for us.

I had to carpool in a public van to a convent school that had the richest and most influential of Pakistani Muslims in attendance. I shared class rooms with the most spoiled and unforgiving spawn of business tycoons, politicians, smugglers and architects who called me a "karanti".

A karanti is a derogatory, slang term for dark Christians, because of course being born as a "darkie" in Pakistan automatically makes you ugly and unimportant with horrible marriage prospects – if any at all. They also degraded my father because he could not afford to drive me to school in a tinted, bullet proof Land Cruiser.

My father's 'shameful' salary as an accounts teacher was not substantial enough for us to mingle with the creme de la creme of Defense; a dingy apartment in Nazimabad and a sputtering motor bike was all we could afford.

Many of the Muslim kids refused to share food with me, nor would they take a bite or sip from anything I may have consumed. I have had girls tell me point blank that their parents have instructed them never to sit and eat with people of other faiths because it's haraam (forbidden). I will tell you what's haraam; teaching your children to hate instead of love...that's what's haraam.

I will never forget an incident in school during a physical education class when, as I was passing the volley ball to a Muslim girl, her eyes suddenly shot daggers at me and she screeched:

Why do you wear that cross with an idol on it?

"This is my prophet...Jesus", I said in a hoarse whisper because mother had always told me never to argue with people about religion.

"Just like you wear that Allah around your neck, I wear the cross."

"Idol worshipping is haraam, and the Prophet hated idol worshippers. You are a kafir (disbeliever)"

The word kafir has resonated within me forever. I was marked, stamped and stained for life as if a member of the kachra class in India.

Gradually, my cousins, aunts and uncles began migrating. My father was offered a sponsorship visa but he refused, saying his duty was to serve and protect Pakistan no matter how many Christians

were killed, executed for false blasphemy cases, paraded naked in village streets and discriminated against in every way.

My mother and I begged him to reconsider.

Page | 53

We asked him to think about the worsening situation of fanaticism in the country and what it could mean for us one day, however he was resilient in his patriotic thinking, putting his service into educating Pakistani children before anything else -even his own family.

I have always felt emotionally and mentally restricted in this country, unable to voice an opinion on anything remotely related to politics or religion, while many of my cousins and relatives continue to live freely in the West.

.....

So, my dear Pakistan, tell me – where shall I go?

Is it fair that we are practicing our religion in a phobic way? Is it fair that I no longer wear my cross because someone may take offence to it?

Jinnah wanted to create a state that would encourage freedom of religion. Today, not only have you all failed Jinnah but you have taken a religion of peace and manipulated it to terrorise us. We cannot be silenced for long.

As Abraham Lincoln said:

If by the mere force of numbers a majority should deprive a minority of any clearly written constitutional right, it might, in a moral point of view, justify a revolution.

Yours sincerely,

A disappointed Pakistani Christian'

Annex on Police and Security force brutality against Christians.

TTMOP p308

Sometime in 1999

Page | 54

A 9 year old Christian boy in Faisalabad, Saleem, gets into a quarrel at school with the son of a Muslim policeman. Foreseeing trouble, the next day Saleem's father, uncle by marriage, and brothers go with him to school, but the policeman attacked Saleem and his brothers. The policeman then got his Christian (female) housekeeper to blame the father and his brother in law for the kidnap of her son, who had disappeared sometime before. The two were promptly arrested, and spent a month in jail being tortured by the police. They would be taken outside the station to private houses and beaten with iron bars, so badly that the father was paralyzed in both arms and legs, and has never worked since, although he has partially regained use of his legs. Eventually released on bail, they struggled for 9 years until, after innumerable hearings, they were both convicted in 2008 and sentenced to five years, although the father was released at least temporarily in December 2008 because of his frail physical state as a result of the police torture.

TTMOP p313

September to November 2002

In Karachi, four gunman (the police claim only two, against the survivors testimony) march into the offices of a Christian welfare organisation that focused on rights for textile and municipal workers. They tie up the eight staff after making sure none of them are Muslims, and shoot 7 of them dead, but leave the last critically injured from a beating. He manages to struggle free and raise the alarm, but after operations remains unconscious in hospital for some time. The one other witness is illegally taken into 'protective custody' by the police but is afraid to tell them anything in case he is killed. They claim he is an accomplice and torture him badly for four weeks to try and gain a 'confession', beating him, electrocuting him and hanging him upside down from the ceiling. They also forced pepper up his anus, made him lie naked on blocks of ice and drugged him. After advocates finally manage to get his wife and a court advocate access to him, police monitor all the conversations and torture him even more severely afterwards. They tell him that if his wife keeps applying to the court for his release, they will kill her and all their children. The court orders him to be released when he enters court barely able to walk, citing his severe mistreatment, but as he leaves court, a mob of police immediately seize him again – when his lawyers try to intervene, they are beaten and their clothes torn. However, as this is done in front of 100's of reporters, they are forced to release him near his home later that night. His family are taken elsewhere for safety and he can't see them for years as a measure to try and protect them. He is kept under house arrest for a year. The police called it 'police protection'. The police refuse to release sketches of the attackers from the two eyewitnesses' testimony. There is a strong suspicion that Pakistan's secret police were involved in the attack. Later, the family have to flee Karachi after years of harassment by the police. The children are forced to scatter to Christian boarding schools. His advocates struggle to find a western nation that will grant him entry and are unsuccessful. Meanwhile, the impoverished families of those slain are continuously followed, harassed and threatened by police to drop their pursuit of justice.

In September 2004, two police officers involved in seizing him after the court released him started to stand trial, and apologized, claiming they did it 'for his protection'. However, when they later don't turn up at court, they are indicted for contempt of court.

..... Several of the culprits are only picked up by chance in early 2012 in a police raid on an extremist group set up to target 'missionaries', finding a large cache of explosives and weapons.

March and April 2003 TTMOP p314

Two Christians are accused of stealing three hundred large and heavy law books after they go missing from a civil service legal office in Lahore. One of the accused, an illiterate janitor whose only means of transport was a bike was accused of stealing them and arrested. He was tortured at the police station, and died of his injuries in hospital later. Hundreds of Christians protest his death. Police force back the protestors violently and one Christian dies of his head injuries.

Page | 55

November 2003 to January 2004 TTMOP p235

A Christian man and his Muslim friend were gambling in Sangla Hill, a town about forty miles west of Lahore. The game turned sour when the Muslim ran up large losses (over \$300) which he didn't want to pay. Witnesses say they saw the Muslim man throw a lighted match into a storage room which contained an old Quran. He then blamed the Christian for the fire, and accused him of blasphemy. Word spread, and mosques started to call for Muslims to defend Islam and 'teach those Christians a lesson'. The next day, two thousand Muslims gathered, including busloads from other areas, prepared with axes, iron rods and petrol. Shouting 'Allah u Akhbar', and 'Down with the Christian dogs', the mob ransacked and looted a Catholic church, a Salvation Army chapel, two Presbyterian churches, a missionary-run school, a convent and several Christian homes. Not only did the police do nothing, but many of them also joined in. They also arrested and tortured four of the accused Christian's brothers. He gave himself to the police in exchange for their release. The mob burned down his and all his brothers houses to the ground.

March 2004 TTMOP p334

A Christian man is preparing for his wedding the next day, when Muslims come in with a paper with his picture and words criticizing Muhammad written on it. He denies writing it, but more copies are found next to a mosque, so the Muslims insist he is arrested. Police torture him for a 'confession', and arrest his uncle, who can't have written it as he is totally illiterate.

April 2008 TTMOP p341

In Lahore, a Christian teenage maid is accused by her employer of theft. The police come and arrest her, and torture her at the police station to gain a 'confession'. Late that night, the police search her home, and find nothing, but arrest and torture her elderly father and three brothers. The men are only released after a crowd gathers outside to protest. The police make no formal charge against the girl.

January 2009 TTMOP p349

Local Muslims told an older Christian to stop preaching a 'false religion' and to stop visiting a local Christian family in the Gujanwrala area, something he had done for decades. When he refused, they then went to the local police, who tried unsuccessfully to bring charges against him. Therefore the local police instruct police in another state to create false robbery charges against his 37 year old son in Sialkot, and the Sialkot police then promptly arrest the son, and then torture him for several days, hanging him upside down from the ceiling all night, beating him and using other torture methods, paralyzing him by breaking his spine. Everyone else arrested in the alleged robbery case was released after paying bribes, but these Christians refused to do so on principle, plus they didn't have the money. The complainant in the robbery testified that the Christian son, Arshad Masih, had not been involved, so the court ordered him released on bail. However, Gujanwrala police immediately filed charges against him by 'unidentified persons' and took him from Sialkot police station before the court order could arrive. They told Masih they would arrange to kill him in a staged police incident if he told the court that he was tortured, but when he arrived at court he was unable to

stand, so the court immediately sent him to hospital, where he remained, chained to his bed, and under 24 hour police guard. The police deliberately hid which police station and which hospital he was at from his family and NGO's. The hospital staff treated him quite roughly, and turned him back over to prison, even though his lawyers said he was illegally held and would be set free soon. His wife is illiterate, so he has to rely on his married sisters for support, and he has had to pull his three children from school because they can no longer afford it.

September 2009 TTMOP p362-4

In a village near Sialkot, on the border with India, a young Christian man called Robert Danish, a worker at the nearby airport, had been in a romantic relationship with a Muslim neighbour for several years. They often met on the roof of their houses, and this angered the girl's mother. She went and told a local cleric about the relationship and came back with a warning that both of them would be killed if they continued. When they met on the roof the next day, the girl refused to talk to him and tried to give Robert a letter explaining why she had to break off their relationship, but he angrily jerked her hand away, and the green book she had in her hand fell into the sewer. Some said it was her personal diary with her explanations, but according to others it was Quranic material. As portions of the Quran are coloured in a similar green, word quickly got around that a Christian had desecrated the Quran. According to some reports the girl cleaned it up and her mother asked how it got dirty, and then went straight to the local imam's wife, while the Christian family went straight to the girl's uncle, asking him to stop the false rumours. He said it was up to the imam, who announced at Friday prayers that the Christians had desecrated the Quran. At the same time, Islamic mobs were arriving branding sticks and calling for the 'blasphemer' to be hung, and occupying one of his houses. Many Christian families started to flee the village, whilst the mob started setting churches on fire. The mob cornered Robert's father and started to beat him, but a cousin arrived on motorbike and somehow managed to grab him and drive off, dodging other mobs. However, Islamicists chased them on two motorbikes, and as they careered onto a main road they barely dodged a truck and the motorbike slipped and fell. The cousin managed to escape but the Muslims captured Robert's father. The mob tied him up and were about to set him on fire when an elderly Muslim said this was too great a punishment and they should only beat him, which they did, whilst untying him and taking him to a church where they burned bibles and hymn books etc. The police arrived and arrested him, not the attackers. Some local Muslims also started setting fire to Christian belongings. In one case, a Muslim man forced a Christian to take off all his clothes except underwear and burned them. The mobs were searching for Robert who was hiding in a house. When they couldn't find him, they attacked a nearby church, taking the cross out and throwing it on the ground, beating it with their shoes. They also beat many Christians. The large police force present did nothing to stop them, but did stop Christians and aid workers from entering the area. Robert crept out in the morning to try and find water to drink and was arrested, although some reports say he gave himself up in return for his father's freedom. He was charged with blasphemy, but no charges were brought against those burning bibles and beating Christians. When he was released, the boy's father was told by the police that they were going to kill his son. He was found the next day in his police cell dead by hanging, and the police claimed it was suicide. However, photographs on his body showed many other bruises apart from round his neck. A post mortem was held by a Christian doctor who said that the cause of death was severe torture, with wounds including broken ribs among others. =

Once the news of his death got out, local Christians started to organize protests, whilst hundreds of Muslim women also protested the very idea that any Muslim woman could be in a relationship with a Christian man. In nearby Sialkot, things turned ugly when the crowd reminded a Christian politician who came that he had promised to resign if there was another incident like Gojra. When it came to the funeral, the family and the many Christians who came tried to bury Robert in the cemetery in his village, but a massive police presence blocked them. The police seized the coffin and forced the family to bury it in the Christian grave yard in Sialkot. The timing of events are unclear, but angry Christian young men hurled stones at the police, while the police baton charged the crowds (allegedly to arrest stone throwers) and also tear-gassed and shot at the funeral procession. Three mourners suffered bullet wounds. Even at the cemetery reports say the police tear-gassed the procession.

November 2010 TTMOP p 392

In Karachi a twenty year old Christian man and an eighteen year old Muslim girl fall in love and run away to another city to marry. Immediately riots started because a Christian man dared to marry a Muslim woman. Within a day mobs of extremists, backed by Taliban and other groups, were roaming Christian areas seizing and beating any young Christian men they could find, and then handing them over to police (not the local police station but another one further away), who also tortured them to give away the couple's location. The mobs also attacked a church, but the police intervened and guarded it. But, the Taliban warned, the police can't stay forever, and then we will destroy it. The traumatized boy tries to save his community by sending official documents of his conversion to Islam and his Muslim marriage to the girl to her parents in the post.

June 2012 TTMOP p425

Two Christian employees are charged with theft after refusing to convert to Islam. The wealthy and influential employer in Karachi had five employees working as domestic workers in his household. For a year he aggressively tried to get the two Christian employees to convert to Islam. Some gold ornaments allegedly went missing in early June, and ten days later the employer lodged an FIR about it, which – you will surely be surprised to hear - only named the Christian employees as suspects and not the Muslim employees. The two Christians volunteered themselves to the local police station when they heard of the accusations. They were transferred to another police station, and their relatives were told by police that if they did not pay a bribe of about £230, then the two Christians would be beaten. The poor families could not pay the bribe, and so the two Christians were severely beaten and tortured, and one was left unable to walk.